FORMS AND FUNCTIONS OF 'LICENCES TO TRANSMIT' (IJĀZAS) IN 18TH-CENTURY-IRAN: 'ABD ALLĀH AL-MŪSAWĪ AL-JAZĀ'IRĪ AL-TUSTARĪ'S (1112–73/1701–59) IJĀZA KABĪRA

Sabine Schmidtke

1

Social aspects of the transmission of knowledge have come into the focus of scholarship in recent years, yet we are still far from having a comprehensive picture, even for specific periods and areas, of the elements that made up the successful career and posthumous reputation of a scholar. Among these elements are different types of documents, whose significance varies over time and space; they include certificates of audition (samā'āt) noted on the margins, at the beginning or end of manuscripts and autobiographical reports about a scholar's studies that circulated as fahrasa, mashyakha (mashīkha), bamāmaj, thabat or mu'jam. One of the most variegated types is the ijāza,

¹ See, e.g., the studies by Jonathan Berkey (*The Transmission of Knowledge in Medieval Cairo. A Social History of Islamic Education*, Princeton 1992), Michael Chamberlain (*Knowledge and Social Practice in Medieval Damascus*, 1190–1350, Cambridge 1994), Stefan Leder ("Charismatic Scripturalism. The Ḥanbalī Maqdisīs of Damascus," *Der Islam* 74 (1997), pp. 279–304), and Daphna Ephrat (*A Learned Society in a Period of Transition. The Sunnī 'Ulama' of Eleventh-Century Baghdad*, Albany 2000).

² See, e.g., Stefan Leder, "Hörerzertifikate als Dokumente für die islamische Lehrkultur des Mittelalters," in Urkunden und Urkundenformulare im Klassischen Altertum und in den orientalischen Kulturen, ed. Raif Georges Khoury, Heidelberg 1999, pp. 147–66; idem, "Eine neue Quelle zur Stadtgeschichte von Damaskus. Zur Alltagsgeschichte der Hadītwissenschaft," in Supplement XI der Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft (26. Deutscher Orientalistentag Leipzig 1995), Stuttgart 1998, pp. 268–79; idem, Spoken word and written text. Meaning and social significance of the Institution of Riwāya, Tokyo 2002, pp. 5ff.; Stefan Leder, Yāsīn Muḥammad al-Sawwās and Ma'mūn al-Ṣāgarǧī, Mu'ǧam al-samāʿāt al-dimašqiyya. Les certificats d'audition à Damas 550–750h./1155–1349, Damascus 1996; idem, Recueil de documents facsimilés des certificats d'audition à Damas 550–750h./1155–1349. Mu'ǧam al-samāʿāt al-dimašqiyya, Damascus 2000. For further references, see Adam Gacek, The Arabic Manuscript Tradition. A Glossary of Technical Terms and Bibliography, Leiden 2001, pp. 216–19.

³ For autobiographical reports of a scholar's studies, see Charles Pellat, "Fahrasa," in *The Encyclopaedia of Islam.* New Edition, vol. 2, pp. 743–44; 'Abd al-'Azīz al-Ahwānī, "Kutub barāmij al-'ulamā' fī l-Andalus," *Majallat ma'had al-makhtūtāt al-'arabiyya* 1 i

or, more specifically the *ijāzat al-riwāya*, the 'license to transmit'. The recipient, or recipients ($muj\bar{a}z$, pl. $muj\bar{a}z\bar{u}n$), is authorized by the issuer $(mu\bar{n}z)$ to transmit to others the contents specified in the $ij\bar{a}za$. They can refer to one or several works, or to a whole body of works that is either precisely specified or only cursorily hinted at. The dividing line between one type of certificate and another is often blurred. If the authorization to transmit follows teaching of the $muj\bar{a}z$ by the mujīz, for example, this is called ijāzat al-samā' or ijāzat al-qirā'a, according to the kind of instruction. Similarly, the description of the course of one's studies can form part of an ijāza.4 It appears that what was originally an oral authorization came more and more to be documented in writing and formalized in structure and terminology in parallel with the growing dominance of the written word and the growing institutionalization of the scholarly culture. Besides the license to transmit that was issued for specified texts, there were text-independent $i\bar{q}az\bar{a}t$ not tied to specific contents or texts. Because of their generally large scope, such documents often no longer appeared in the margins or at the beginning or end of other texts, but themselves became autonomous texts, sometimes in the form of books, often with their own titles.⁵ The contents authorized to be transmitted were usually comprehensive, frequently comprising the whole literature of a certain scholarly tradition (\(\bar{y}\bar{a}za\) kab\(\bar{v}ra\) or \(\bar{y}\bar{a}za\) $\bar{a}mma$).

^{(1374/1955),} pp. 91–120; Jacqueline Sublet, Les maîtres et les études de deux traditionistes de l'époque mamelouke. Al-Mashyakha al-Bāsima lil-Qibābī wa Fāṭima de Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī. Etude analytique, Damascus 1967; Georges Vajda, "La transmission de la mašyaḥa (Asnā l-maqāṣid wa-aʿdab al-mawārid) d'Ibn al-Buḥārī d'après le manuscrit Reisülküttab 262 de la Bibliothèque Süleymaniye d'Istanbul," Rivista degli studi orientali 48 (1973–74), pp. 55–74. See also Devin J. Stewart, "Capital, Accumulation, and the Islamic Academic Biography," Edebiyât 7 (1997), pp. 345–62, esp. 345–46.

⁴ For studies about this genre, see Gacek, Arabic Manuscript Tradition, pp. 216–19; Cemil Akpinar, "Icâzet," in Türkiye Diyanet Vakfi İslâm Ansiklopedisi, vol. 21, pp. 393–400; Devin Stewart, "The Doctorate of Islamic Law in Mamluk Egypt and Syria," in Law and Education in Medieval Islam. Studies in Memory of Professor George Makdisi, eds. Joseph E. Lowry, Devin J. Stewart, and Shawkat M. Toorawa, London 2004, pp. 45–90; see also my "The ÿāza from 'Abd Allāh b. Ṣāliḥ al-Samāhījī to Nāṣir al-Jārūdī al-Qaṭīfī. A Source for the Twelver Shi'i Scholarly Tradition of Baḥrayn," in Culture and Memory in Medieval Islam. Essays in Honour of Wilferd Madelung, eds. Farhad Daftary and Josef W. Meri, London 2003, pp. 64–85, esp. 78 n. 1.

⁵ See, e.g., Āghā Buzurg al-Ṭihrānī, al-Dharī'a ilā taṣānīf al-shī'a 1-25, Beirut 1403-6/1983-86, vol. 1, p. 174 nos. 874, 876, 877, p. 185 no. 957, p. 198 no. 1033, p. 265 no. 1393.

The majority of $i\bar{j}a\bar{z}at$ al-riwaya within the Imami tradition follow a more or less fixed pattern, with formalized phrases that serve as demarcators for the different building blocks of the document. The opening prayer is followed by an introduction, naming the issuer and the recipient as well as the occasion on which the licence was issued. This is followed by the main section detailing the contents and extent of the $i\bar{j}aza$. It usually begins with the formula ijaztu lahu an yarwiya fanna... Very often the ijaza includes detailed information on his own shaykhs and their chains of transmission. The ijaza usually ends with the conditions attached to it—introduced by formulas such as ijazivaya
A typical core element of the text-independent *ijāza kabīra* or *ijāza fāmma* is the autobibliography of the *mujīz*, usually a complete list of his works, often including even unfinished writings and providing details about the size, content, or other special characteristics of the individual titles.⁷

⁶ The majority of known $i\bar{g}aza$ issued by Imami scholars from the 4th/10th to the 14th/20th century is listed in Āghā Buzurg al-Ṭihrānī's (d. 1389/1970) bibliography of Imami literature, al-Dharī'a ilā taṣānīf al-shī'a (as n. 5).—In addition to the $i\bar{g}azat$ al-riwāya, more specific types of $i\bar{g}azat$ evolved, such as the 'licence to teach and to issue legal opinions' ($i\bar{g}azat$ al-tadrīs va-l-iftā') in the Sunni world, which is said to go back to the 3rd/9th century (see Stewart, "Doctorate of Islamic Law."), or the $i\bar{g}azat$ al-ifthād ($i\bar{g}aza$ ifthādiyya), which is to be encountered among the Imamis from about the mid-19th century onwards. See, e.g., Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 157 nos. 773, 776, pp. 168–69 no. 845, p. 169 no. 852, p. 173 nos. 868, 871, p. 195 no. 1014, vol. 11, pp. 13–14 no. 63, p. 14 no. 67, p. 15 no. 74, pp. 23–24 no. 132; for this genre, see also Devin J. Stewart, Islamic Legal Orthodoxy. Twelver Shiite Responses to the Sunni Legal System, Salt Lake City 1998, pp. 224ff.

⁷ Examples of autobibliographical lists within $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$ belonging to the Imami tradition are the $ij\bar{a}za$ issued by Abu 1-Fath 'Uthmān al-Naḥwī (d. 392/1001–2) for Abū 'Abd Allāh al-Ḥusayn b. Aḥmad b. Naṣr (cf. Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 208 no. 1083); the $ij\bar{a}za$ of the Sharīf al-Murtaḍā (d. 436/1044) issued in Sha'bān 417/September-October 1026 for Abu 1-Ḥasan Muḥammad b. Muḥammad al-Buṣrawī (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 216 no. 1132; 'Abd Allāh b. 'Īsā al-Afandī, Riyāḍ al-'ulamā' 1–5, ed. Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī, Qum 1401/1981, vol. 4, pp. 34–39; cf. also Stewart, Islamic Legal Orthodoxy, p. 147); the $ij\bar{a}za$ granted by Ibn Shahrāshūb (d. 588/1192) to Jamāl al-Dīn 'Alī Ibn Sha'ara al-Ḥillī al-Jāma'ānī (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 243 no. 1286); the $ij\bar{a}za$ of the 'Allāma al-Ḥillī for Muḥannā' b. Sinān, which apart from the autobibliography arranged by disciplines does not contain any other element (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 178 no. 911; printed in Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī, Biḥār al-anwār 0–28, 35–110, ed. Jawād 'Alawī [et al.], Tehran 1376–1405/1957–85, vol. 107, pp. 147–49); the $ij\bar{a}za$ of Ibn Abī Jumhūr al-Aḥsā'ī, issued on Monday,

An essential function of comprehensive, text-independent $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$ is the documentation of the scholarly tradition, first and foremost the scholars making up the $muj\bar{\imath}z$'s chains of transmission. Moreover, it is not unusual for presentations of scholars to elaborate on other persons who were somehow connected to them, such as family members or predecessors and successors in public office, irrespective of

10 Jumādā I 896/21 March 1491, for Muḥammad b. Ṣāliḥ al-Gharawī (Dharī'a, vol. 1, pp. 241-42 no. 1280. A manuscript copy of the $y\bar{a}za$ is to be found in ms. Dublin, Chester Beatty 3810, ff. 328r-329v. See my Theologie, Philosophie und Mystik im zwölferschütischen Islam des 9./15. Jahrhunderts. Die Gedankenwelt des Ibn Abī Jumhūr $al-Ahs\bar{a}^{\dot{i}}\bar{i}$ (um 838/1434-35—nach 906/1501), Leiden 2000, p. 270); the $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}$ of al-Shahīd al-thānī issued on 14 Dhu l-Ḥijja 964/7 October 1557 for Tāj al-Dīn b. Hilāl al-Jazā'irī (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 193 no. 1000); the ÿāzas of Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī for one of his students in Mashhad (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 149 no. 712) and for Muḥammad Ja'far al-Ṭāliqānī issued in 1095/1684 ($Dhar\bar{i}'a$, vol. 1, p. 150 no. 715); the $ij\bar{a}za$ granted in 1111/1699–1700 by Sulaymān b. 'Abd Allāh al-Māhūzī to Muḥammad al-Lārī (*Dharī a*, vol. 1, p. 197 no. 1024); the $y\bar{a}za$ of 'Abd Allāh b. Şāliḥ al-Samāhījī (d. 1135/1722) issued on 23 Şafar 1127/17 February 1716 for Nāṣir al-Jārūdī al-Qaṭīfī (ed. Mahdī al-ʿAwāzim al-Qaṭīfī, Qum [1419/1998–99], pp. 51–60. Cf. my "The ÿāza," pp. 68–69); the ÿāza granted in 1153/1740 by Yūsuf b. Aḥmad al-Darrāzī al-Baḥrānī to 'Abd Allāh b. 'Alawī al-Bilādī al-Baḥrānī (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 266 no. 1394); the $y\bar{a}za$ of Radī al-Dīn al-Mūsawī al-'Āmilī al-Makkī (d. 1168/1754–55) issued in 1155/1742–43 for two recipients (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 192 no. 946); the ÿāza granted in 1167/1754 by Ḥusayn b. Muḥammad b. 'Abd al-Nabī al-Bilādī to 'Abd al-'Azīz b. Aḥmad al-Ṣādiqī al-Najafī (*Dharī'a*, vol. 1, pp. 189–90 no. 983); the *yāza* issued in 1218/1803–4 by Dildār 'Alī b. Muḥammad al-Naqawī al-Naṣīr Ābādī to his son Muḥammad (*Dharī'a*, vol. 1, p. 191 no. 990); the yāza granted by Ḥusayn b. Muḥammad al-Darrāzī al-Baḥrānī (d. 1216/1801-2) to Ahmad al-Aḥṣā'ī (d. 1214/1826) (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 188 no. 976); the *yāza*s granted by Husayn b. al-Sayyid Dildār 'Alī (d. 1273/1856–57) to his son (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 184 no. 948) and to his nephew (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 184 no. 949); the *ÿāza* granted by Muḥammad Rafī' b. 'Abd al-Muḥammad al-Kawārī al-Kazāzī to 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. Muḥammad al-Karharūdī al-Sulṭān Ābādī (Dharī'a, vol. 1, pp. 192–93 no. 997); the yāza of Yūsuf al-Baḥrānī known as Lu'lu'at al-Baḥrayn (ed. Muḥammad Ṣādiq Baḥr al-'Ulūm, Najaf 1386/1966). For al-Baḥrānī's autobiographical entry in Lu'lu'at al-Bahrayn, containing his autobibliography, see the analysis of Stewart, "Capital," pp. 345-62, as well as the partial translation of the text by idem, "The Autobiography of Yūsuf al-Baḥrānī (1696-1772)," in Interpreting the Self. Autobiography in the Arabic Literary Tradition, ed. Dwight F. Reynolds, Berkeley 2001, pp. 216–23. Generally for this work, cf. Marco Salati, "La *Lu'lu'a* <sic> al-baḥrayn fi l-iǧāza li-qurratay al-'ayn di Šayḫ Yūsuf b. Aḥmad al-Baḥrānī (1107–86/ 1695–1772). Per lo studio della šī'a di Baḥrayn," Annali de Ca' Foscari. Serie Orientale 28 iii (1989), pp. 111-45.—An example of such an inventory in an *ijāza* by a Sunni author is the autobibliographical yaza of the Eygptian ophthalmologist and encyclopedist Ibn al-Afkānī (d. 749/1348). Cf. Jan Just Witkam, "Lists of books in Arabic manuscripts," Manuscripts of the Middle East 5 (1990–91), pp. 126–30.—For $ij\bar{a}zas$ by Imami scholars containing partial autobibliographies, see Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 151 no. 726, p. 197 no. 1022, pp. 238–39 no. 1260, vol. 11, p. 13 no. 59, p. 15 no. 76, p. 23 no. 130.

whether these persons were links in the $muj\bar{\imath}z$'s chains of transmission or not. For the sake of documentation, a $muj\bar{\imath}z$ often quotes complete $ij\bar{\imath}aza$ s by earlier scholars in his own licence, even if they were not his own teachers.⁸ Thus this type of $ij\bar{\imath}aza$ fulfills, among other purposes, functions similar to those of biographical works. In many cases these two genres cannot be clearly distinguished.⁹ Documentation of one's own scholarly tradition is also the motive behind the compilation of independent collections of $ij\bar{\imath}az\bar{\imath}at$ ($kutub\ al-ij\bar{\imath}az\bar{\imath}at$).¹⁰

Despite the large number of such documents that are available to us and their indisputable value as source material for the reconstruction of the history of scholarly traditions and networks, and their respective curricula, the social meaning and impact of those documents as constitutive elements of a successful career and the posthumous reputation of a scholar need to be studied carefully. There are numerous examples of scholars who considered the $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$ they received throughout their lives as evidence of their own reputation; this can be seen from the way they collected and displayed them in their own writings.¹¹ But there were equally accomplished scholars who took

 $^{^8}$ See, e.g., Āghā Buzurg, *Dharī* 'a, vol. 1, p. 134 no. 627, p. 165 no. 826, p. 172 no. 864, pp. 193–94 no. 1002, p. 221 no. 1160, p. 230 no. 1207, p. 236 nos. 1238, 1239, p. 244 no. 1289.

⁹ A Twelver Shi'i example from the 12th/18th century is Lu'lu' at al-Baḥrayn, a tabaqāt-work of Imami culture (as n. 7), though this is technically an yāza issued by Yūsuf b. Aḥmad al-Baḥrānī for two of his nephews; examples from the 14th/20th century are al-Lum'a al-mahdīya ilā l-ṭuruq al-ʿilmīya by Ḥasan b. Hādī b. Muḥammad 'Alī al-ʿĀmilī al-Kāzimī (1272/1855–56–1354/1935–36), technically also an yāza issued for Mahdī b. Muḥammad Taqī al-Iṣfahānī in 1329/1911. Cf. Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 174 no. 877; vol. 18, pp. 354–55 no. 452; furthermore Bughyat al-wu'āt fī ṭabaqāt mashāyikh al-yāzāt, again a ṭabaqāt-work which formally is an yāza, issued in 1326/1908–9 by the same Ḥasan al-Mūsawī al-Kāzimī for Muḥammad Murtaqā al-Ḥusaynī al-Janfūrī (d. about 1333/1914–15). Cf. Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 174 no. 874, vol. 3, p. 137 no. 464. Ḥasan al-Mūsawī al-Kāzimī granted a third yāza, entitled al-Tabaqāt, which apparently belongs to the same genre; see Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 174 no. 876. He moreover granted an extensive yāza to Āghā Buzurg al-Ṭihrānī which also contains a section dedicated to ṭabaqāt; cf. Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 174 no. 878.

¹⁰ For a survey of such collections in Twelver Shi'i Islam, see Āghā Buzurg, *Dhan*ī'a, vol. 1, pp. 123–31.

There are numerous examples of scholars who quote the $y\bar{a}zas$ they had received earlier in $y\bar{a}zas$ they later issued for their own students; see, e.g., Aghā Buzurg, $Dhar\bar{\iota}^{a}$, vol. 1, p. 159 no. 785 ($y\bar{a}za$ granted by Muḥammad Bāqir al-Nīsābūrī al-Makkī to Naṣr Allāh b. al-Ḥusayn al-Mudarris al-Ḥā'irī in 1130/1718 in which the $muy\bar{\imath}z$ quotes the $y\bar{\imath}aza$ he was granted by 'Alī Khān al-Madanī), p. 168 no. 843 ($y\bar{\imath}aza$ granted by Ḥasan b. Aḥmad al-Kāshānī to Yaḥyā b. Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan al-Ḥindī in 1337/1918–19 in which the $muy\bar{\imath}z$ quotes the $y\bar{\imath}az\bar{\imath}a$ he was granted by

pride in never having received an $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$ throughout their lives. ¹² A quantitative analysis of more than 900 Imami $i\bar{y}\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$ from the 4th/10th to the 14th/20th century listed by Āghā Buzurg (d. 1389/1970) in his bibliography of Imami literature, al- $Dhar\bar{\iota}'a$ $il\bar{a}$ $ta\bar{s}an\bar{\iota}'f$ al- $sh\bar{\iota}'a$, ¹³ suggests that the $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$ s granted by a scholar were of much higher value for his scholarly reputation than the ones he received. One indication for this is that the entries are arranged according to the names of the issuers of the $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$ s, an arrangement that is also characteristic for most $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$ collections ($kutub\ al$ - $i\bar{y}\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$). ¹⁴ Moreover, among the scholars who issued the most $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$ s during their own lifetime, the number of $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$ s they are reported to have received is significantly lower. ¹⁵

his teachers), p. 223 no. 1168 (ÿāza granted by 'Alī b. Hilāl al-Karakī to Malik Muḥammad b. Sulṭān Ḥusayn al-Iṣfahānī in 984/1576-77 in which the mujīz quotes the *yāza* he was granted by the Muhaqqiq al-Karakī), p. 244 no. 1279 (*yāza* granted by Muḥammad b. 'Alī b. Khātūn Ābādī to Nūr al-Dīn 'Alī b. al-Ḥusayn al-'Ālī al-Karakī in which the $mu\bar{i}z$ quotes the $i\bar{j}\bar{a}za$ issued to him by Jamāl al-Dīn Ahmad b. al-Ḥājj 'Alī al-'Īnāthī; see also Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 141 no. 667). See also Dharī'a, vol. 11, p. 14 no. 64, p. 19 no. 100, p. 25 no. 145. For a majmū'a of ijāzāt collected by scholars of the 13th/19th century, see *Dharī'a*, vol. 11, p. 20 nos. 105–10. Examples from the 14th/20th century are Mīrzā Muḥammad 'Alī Mudarris Tabrīzī, who includes in the introduction to his biographical dictionary Rayḥānat al-adab fī tarājim al-ma'rūfīn bi-l-kunya wa-l-laqab (Tabrīz 1967–70, vol. 8, pp. 18–19, 25, 27, 29, 30–31) facsimiles of taqnīz statements granted to him by leading jurists of his time, and the collection of yāzāt that Muhammad Ḥusayn al-Mar'ashī (1315–1411/1897–1990) had received throughout his life, edited by his son Maḥmūd al-Mar'ashī (Musalsalāt fī l-ijāzāt muḥtawiya 'alā ijāzāt 'ulamā' al-islām fī ḥaqq wālidī al-'Allāma Āyat Allāh aluzmā al-Sayyid Ábī l-Maʿālī Shihāb al-Dīn al-Ḥusaynī al-Marʿashī al-Najafī 1–2, Qum 1416/[1995-96]).

¹² E.g. 'Alī b. Ḥasan al-Bilādī al-Baḥrānī (d. 1340/1922) as he states in an autobiographical entry in his *Anwār al-badrayn fī tarājim 'ulamā' al-Qaṭīf wa-l-Aḥsā' wa-l-Baḥrayn*, Najaf 1377/1957, pp. 271–72. See also Rainer Brunner, "'Siehe, was mich an Unglück und Schrecken traf!' Schiitische Autobiographien," in *Islamstudien ohne Ende. Festschrift für Werner Ende zum 65. Geburtstag*, eds. Rainer Brunner et al., Würzburg 2002, p. 67.

¹³ Āghā Buzurg, *al-Dharīʿa*, vol. 1, pp. 131–266 nos. 619–1398; vol. 11, pp. 13–29 nos. 58–170.

¹⁴ E.g. Ijāzāt al-ḥadīth allatī katabahā...al-Mawlā Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī al-Isbahānī, ed. Ahmad al-Husaynī, Qum 1410/1989-90.

These are, according to Āghā Buzurg, in chronological order the 'Allāma al-Ḥillī (d. 726/1325) [17 ÿāzas] (Dharīʿa, vol. 1, pp. 175–78 nos. 897–912, vol. 11, pp. 17–18 no. 89), his son Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn (d. 771/1370) [16 ÿāzas] (Dharīʿa, vol. 1, pp. 234–37 nos. 1231–44), al-Muḥaqqiq al-Karakī (d. 940/1533) [18 ÿāzas] (Dharīʿa, vol. 1, pp. 212–16 nos. 1111–28), al-Shahīd al-thānī (d. 966/1558) [9 ÿāzas] (Dharīʿa, vol. 1, pp. 193–94 nos. 998–1006), Bahāʾ al-Dīn al-ʿĀmilī (d. 1031/1622 or 1032/1623) [31 ÿāzas] (Dharīʿa, vol. 1, pp. 237–39 nos. 1245–66, vol. 11, p. 24 nos. 136, 137), Taqī al-Dīn al-Majlisī (d. 1070/1659) [11 ÿāzas] (Dharīʿa, vol. 1,

In addition to the mere quantitative aspect, it apparently also mattered to a scholar's standing which type of $ij\bar{a}za$ he issued. It seems that the primary function of the $ij\bar{a}za$ ' $\bar{a}mma$ or $ij\bar{a}za$ $kab\bar{i}ra$, which was typically composed by scholars more advanced in age, was to underline the issuer's reputation as an accomplished scholar among his contemporaries and for generations to come. In modern times, this genre is often replaced by autobiographies.¹⁶

pp. 161-63 nos. 804-13, vol. 11, pp. 15-16 nos. 77, 78), Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī (d. 1110/1698–99 or 1111/1699–1700) [75 *ÿāza*s] (*Dharī'a*, vol. 1, pp. 148–56 nos. 699–766, vol. 11, pp. 14–15 nos. 68–73), al-Waḥīd al-Bihbahānī (d. c. 1207/1792) [9 ÿāzas] (Dharī a, vol. 1, pp. 147-48 nos. 689-97, see also vol. 11, p. 14 no. 65), Baḥr al-ʿUlūm (d. 1212/1797) [11 *ȳāzas*] (*Dharīʿa*, vol. 1, pp. 255–56 nos. 1343–51), Muḥammad Bāqir al-Shaftī al-Iṣfahānī (d. 1260/1844) [16 *ȳāzas*] (*Dharīʿa*, vol. 1, pp. 156–58 nos. 767–82), Ḥasan b. Hādī b. Muḥammad ʿAlī al-ʿĀmilī al-Kāzimī (d. 1354/1935-36) [22 ÿāzas] (Dharīʿa, vol. 1, pp. 174-75 nos. 874-95). Neither the 'Allāma al-Ḥillī nor his son Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn is mentioned as a recipient of ijāzas, and the same holds true for earlier authors, although the total number of ÿāzas issued by single scholars that are known is of course much lower. Both Ibn Bābawayh and al-Sharīf al-Murtadā are reported to have issued two $y\bar{a}zas$ each, yet neither of them is listed as the recipient of an *ijāza*; for Ibn Bābawayh, see Āghā Buzurg, *Dharī'a*, vol. 1, p. 216 nos. 1130, 1131; for al-Sharīf al-Murtaḍā, see ibid., vol. 1, p. 216 nos. 1132, 1133. Al-Muḥaqqiq al-Karakī is mentioned only three times as mujāz (Dharī a, vol. 1, pp. 133-34 no. 621, p. 222 no. 1166, p. 244 no. 1289), al-Shahīd al-thānī and Bahā' al-Dīn al-'Āmilī are not mentioned as mujāz, Taqī al-Dīn al-Majlisī is listed as the recipient of one ijāza (Dharī'a, vol. 1, pp. 209-10 no. 1092), Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī as the recipient of eleven yāzas (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 162 nos. 805, 806, p. 200 no. 1043, p. 212 no. 1110, p. 220 no. 1155, p. 228 no. 1194, p. 233, p. 252 no. 1327, p. 257 no. 1354, vol. 11, pp. 15–16 no. 77, p. 24 no. 135), al-Waḥīd al-Bihbahānī is not mentioned as *mujāz*, Baḥr al-'Ulūm is listed eight times as recipient of an *ÿāza* (*Dharīʿa*, vol. 1, p. 147 no. 695, p. 148 no. 698, p. 180 nos. 924, 926, p. 200 no. 1047, p. 207 no. 1080, p. 254 no. 1342, p. 266 no. 1398), Muḥammad Bāqir al-Shaftī al-Işfahānī and Ḥasan b. Hādī al-'Āmilī al-Kāzimī do not figure as mujāz. A telling counter example is Shaykh Ahmad b. Zayn al-Dīn al-Aḥṣā'ī (d. 1241/1820), who had studied with the leading scholars of his time but whose views were later considered heterodox and who was not part of the Imami scholarly establishment; he is the only scholar to receive more $i\bar{j}\bar{a}zas$ than he issued. Aḥmad al-Aḥsā'ī is mentioned as $muj\bar{i}z$ in three cases (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 141 nos. 662-64) and as mujāz in six cases (Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 141 no. 661, p. 165 no. 821, p. 188 no. 976, p. 219 no. 1149, p. 253 no. 1331, p. 255 no. 1344; see also Armin Eschraghi, Frühe Šaihī- und Bābī-Theologie. Die Darlegung der Beweise für Muḥammads besonderes Prophetentum (Ar-Risāla fī Itbāt an-Nubūwa al-Ḥāṣṣa), Leiden et al. 2004, p. 11). It seems to be out of humility that Āghā Buzurg lists only one $ij\bar{a}za$ granted by himself and remarks that he has issued some twenty licences in total but omitted to mention this because of their number. See Dharī'a, vol. 1, p. 229 no. 1199 (*ÿāza* granted to 'Abbās b. al-Ḥājj Mawlā Ḥājjī al-Ṭihrānī in 1330/1912).

¹⁶ For an overview of autobiographical writings among Imamis, see Brunner, "Schiitische Autobiographien," pp. 59–68. See also *Autobiographie d'un clerc chiite du Ğabal 'Āmil . . .* Traduction et annotations par Sabrina Mervin et Haïtham al-Amin,

2

In what follows I intend to examine an $ij\bar{a}za$ that belongs to the genre of text-independent *ijāza 'āmma*, covering more or less the entire culture and literature of Imami scholarship. The $ij\bar{a}za$ was granted by Sayyid 'Abd Allāh al-Mūsawī al-Jazā'irī al-Tustarī (1112–73/1701–59) four years before his death to four recipients.¹⁷ In the introduction, al-Tustarī names two recipients, Muhammad b. Karam Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī (d. 1172/1758–59) and the latter's nephew, Ibrāhīm b. 'Abd Allāh al-Huwayzī (d. 1197/1782–83). Al-Tustarī reports that the two visited him after he had not seen them for a long time. On this occasion he introduced them to some of his writings ($masf\bar{u}r\bar{a}t$), which they had not known before and which they immediately studied eagerly. The two decided to transmit al-Tustarī's writings and through him the writings of earlier scholars and therefore asked him to issue an *ijāza* for them which he subsequently granted.¹⁸ The humility of al-Tustarī's account indicates that the two were at the time already accomplished scholars whom the author esteemed highly. Towards the end of the ijāza, al-Tustarī includes two further persons among its recipients; Ibrāhīm b. 'Abd Allāh b. Nāṣir al-Ḥuwayzī al-Humaylī and Muḥammad b. Muḥammad b. Darwish Muhammad al-Isbahānī al-Gharawī had asked him in writing many years earlier to grant them an $ij\bar{a}za$, 19 which at the time he had been unable to do (he does not tell us why).²⁰

Damascus 1998. For a survey of the genre in Arabic and Islamic literature, see Franz Rosenthal, "Die arabische Autobiographie," Studia Arabica 1 (1937) [= Analecta Orientalia; 14], pp. 3–40 [repr. in Franz Rosenthal, Muslim Intellectual and Social History. A Collection of Essays, Aldershot 1990, part V]; Dwight F. Reynolds (ed.), Interpreting the Self. Autobiography in the Arabic Literary Tradition, Berkeley 2001.

¹⁷ Ål-Ijāza al-kabīra li-l-'Allāma . . . 'Abd Allāh al-Mūsawī al-Jazā'irī al-Tustarī, ed. Muḥammad al-Samāmī al-Ḥā'irī, Qum 1409/[1988–89]. Apart from this edition, I consulted a manuscript copy of the *ijāza* copied from the autograph by Abu l-Ḥasan b. Muḥammad Muḥsin b. Abi l-Ḥasan (copy completed on 26 Ramaḍān 1231/20 August 1816) that is preserved in the Library of Congress (Call Number: BP63.I72H884 1815 [Orien Arab]). For the *ijāza*, dated 2 Jumādā II 1168/16 March 1755, see also Āghā Buzurg, *Dharī'a*, vol. 1, pp. 206–7 no. 1077.

¹⁸ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 4: . . . ilā an waqa'a ikhtiyāruhum . . . 'alā riwāyatihā 'annī wa-riwāyat mā arwīhā min muşannafāt 'ulamā' inā . . .

¹⁵ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, pp. 21Ĭ-12: qad istajāzanī qabla hādha bi-aʿwām mukātabatan min al-Ḥuwayza . . . Ibrāhīm . . . wa- . . . Muḥammad.

²⁰ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 212: fa-li-yu'lam annahumā . . . sharīkān ma'a l-shaykhayn al-mutaqaddimayn fi hādhihi l-ijāza

Al-Tustarī is a well-known Imami scholar about whose life and work most relevant biographical works contain ample information.²¹ While many of his writings in Arabic and Persian, such as commentaries on legal works of earlier Imamis, treatises dealing with astronomy, and collections of responsa are extant, only his chronicle on Shūshtar (*Tadhkira-yi Shūshtar*) and the *ijāza* discussed here have been published so far. The *Tadhkira-yi Shūshtar* also contains a brief autobiographical and autobibliographical paragraph.²² By contrast, next to nothing is known about the four recipients of the *ijāza*. The few biographical works that have entries on them refer almost exclusively to the information provided by al-Tustarī in his *ijāza*.²³

A comparison of the present document with other comprehensive, text-independent Imami $ij\bar{a}zas$ reveals a number of common features characteristic of this genre. But it also contains a number of special features concerning form and content that set it apart from comparable documents.

b. Karam Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī (d. 1172/1758–59) cf. Āl Maḥbūba, *Māḍā al-Najaf*, vol. 2, p. 189; al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 10, p. 44; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 661.—For Ibrāhīm b. 'Abd Allāh b. Nāṣir al-Ḥuwayzī al-Humaylī cf. al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 2, p. 182; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 7.—For Muḥammad b. Muḥammad b. Darwīsh Muḥammad al-Iṣbahānī al-Gharawī cf. Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 642; idem, *Dharī'a*, vol. 21, p. 56; Āl Maḥbūba, *Māḍā al-Najaf*, vol. 3, p. 382; al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 10, p. 58.

²¹ Muḥammad Bāqir al-Khwānsārī, Rawḍāt al-jannāt fī aḥwāl al-ʿulamāʾ wa-l-sādāt, Qum 1381/1987, vol. 4, pp. 257–61 no. 392; Muḥsin al-Amīn, Aʿyān al-shīʿa 1–11, Beirut 1403/1983, vol. 8, p. 87; Āghā Buzurg al-Ṭihrānī, Tabaqāt aʿlām al-shīʿa, vols. 1–2, Beirut 1390–91/1971; vols. 3–5, ed. ʿAlī Naqī Munzawī, Beirut 1392–95/1972–75; vol. 6, ed. ʿAlī Naqī Munzawī, Tehran 1362/1983, vol. 6, pp. 456–59; idem, Muṣaffā al-maqāl fī muṣannifī ʿlm al-rijāl, ed. Aḥmad Munzawī, Tehran 1378/1959, pp. 246–47; ʿUmar Riḍā Kaḥḥāla, Muʿjam al-muʾallifīn. Tarājim muṣannifī l-kutub al-ʿarabiyya 1–15, Beirut 1414/1993, vol. 6, p. 160; Mudarris Tabrīzī, Rayḥānat al-adab, vol. 2, p. 254; ʿAbbās al-Qummī, al-Fawāʾid al-raḍawiyya fī aḥwāl ʿulamāʾ madhhab al-jaʿfariyya, Tehran 1327/1948, p. 256; Dāʾirat-i maʿārif-i tashayyuʿ, vol. 5, pp. 354–55. Cf. also GALS, vol. 2, p. 586.

²² Tadhkira-i Shūṣhtar. An Account of Shūṣhtar, from the earliest time to A.H. 1169. With notices of its celebrated men and memories of the author's life 1–2. By Sayyid 'Abdallāh Bin Nūr al-Dīn Bin Nī'matallāh al-Ḥusaynī aṣh-Shūṣhtarī (surnamed Faqir), eds. Khān Bahādur Mawlā Bakhsh and Shams-ul-'Ulamā' M. Hidayet Husayn, Calcutta: Asiatic Society of Bengal, 1912–24 (Bibliotheca Indica; 206), pp. 60–61. See also C.A. Storey, Persian Literature. A Bio-Bibliographical Survey, London 1927–39, vol. 1 i, p. 365 no. 486; Aḥmad Munzawī, Fihrist-i nuskhahā-yi khaṭṭī-yi fārsī 1–6, Tehran 1348–51/1969–72, vol. 6, pp. 4289–91; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 3, pp. 243–45 no. 900.

²³ For Ibrāhīm b. 'Abd Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī (d. 1197/1782–83) cf. Ja'far b. Bāqir Āl Maḥbūba, Māḍī al-Najaf wa-ḥāḍiruhā, Najaf 1955–57, vol. 2, pp. 182; al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 2, pp. 181–82; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 7.—For Muḥammad b. Karam Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī (d. 1172/1758–59) cf. Āl Maḥbūba, Māḍī al-Najaf, vol. 2, pp. 189; al Amīn, 4'yān, vol. 2, pp. 189; al Amīn, 4'yān, vol. 2, pp. 189; al Amīn, 4'yān, vol. 10, pp. 44; Ārabā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6

To link later generations back to the Prophet and within Shi'ism to the Imams traditionally serves the purpose of guaranteeing the veracity of what is transmitted; in addition, it was considered as pious usage. As a result of the canonization of the hadīth literature, the significance of the *isnād* as a technical auxiliary decreased, whereas its significance as a blessing grew.²⁴ Al-Tustarī addresses the issue of the function of granting an $ij\bar{a}za$ on various occasions. In the introduction he states that the two recipients of the $ij\bar{a}za$, Muhammad and Ibrāhīm al-Ḥuwayzī, are not in need of it, as they had apparently received sufficient $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$, through which they already had their place within the network of Imami scholars secured. Rather, they wanted to add further chains to their chains of transmission.²⁵ The author discusses the function of issuing $i\bar{a}zas$ again in the context of theoretical elaborations on grammatical, etymological and functional aspects of such documents. Here, al-Tustarī states that the purpose of issuing $i\bar{q}az\bar{a}t$ in particular for the four canonical hadith collections of the Imamis as well as for other writings of their compilers al-Kulīnī (d. 329/941), Ibn Bābawayh (d. 381/991) and al-Shaykh al-Tūsī (d. 460/1067)²⁶—is only to receive blessings, whereas the

 $^{^{24}}$ Yūsuf al-Baḥrānī (d. 1186/1772) states, for example, in the introduction to his $iy\bar{a}za$ granted to Muḥammad Mahdī Baḥr al-ʿUlūm (d. 1212/1797–98) (transl. Robert Gleave, "The $Iy\bar{a}za$ from Yūsuf al-Baḥrānī (d. 1186/1772) to Sayyid Muḥammad Mahdī Baḥr al-ʿUlūm (d. 1212/1797–8)," Iran. Journal of the British Institute of Persian Studies 32 (1994), p. 116): "There is no doubt that an $iy\bar{a}za$ is appropriate in these times; even if it is of little use for confirming the $akhb\bar{a}r$ and proving the paths which stem from the illustrious scholars, [it is of little use] because they are so famous that they cannot be denied, particularly the four books which are as clear as the sun in every land. Since our scholarly predecessors have done this [i.e. given $iy\bar{a}zas$], seeking good fortune and blessing in connecting this noble and holy chain back to the Imams, we shall follow their example, agreeing with what they agree and rejecting what they reject." A similar view was already made explicit by the seventh/thirteenth century ix hadīth expert Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ al-Shahrazūrī (d. 643/1245), see Eerik Dickinson, "Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ al-Shahrazūrī and the isnād," ix Journal of the American Oriental Society 122 (2002), pp. 481–505.

²⁵ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 4: wa-dhālika lā li-hāja minhumā ilayhi bal tawassu'an fī turuq al-riwāya.

²⁶ În addition to the four Imami canonical ħadīth collections (al-kutub al-arba'a li-l-Muḥammadīn al-thalātha) al-Tustarī enumerates the following writings of Ibn Bābawayh: al-Amālī (cf. Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 2, p. 315 no. 1251), 'Ilal al-sharā'ī' (cf. Dharī'a, vol. 15, p. 313 no. 2005), 'Uyūn al-akhbār (he presumaby means 'Uyūn akhbār al-Ridā; cf. Dharī'a, vol. 15, p. 375 no. 2367), K. al-Tawhīd (cf. Dharī'a, vol. 4, p. 482 no. 2154), Thawāb al-a'māl (cf. Dharī'a, vol. 5, p. 18 no. 77), K. 'Iqāb al-a'māl (cf. Dharī'a, vol. 15, p. 280 no. 1828), K. Ma'ānī al-akhbār (cf. Dharī'a, vol. 21, p. 204 no. 4622) as well as al-Khiṣāl (cf. Dharī'a, vol. 7, p. 162 no. 876).

transmission of these works, as well as the legal practice in accordance with them, does not require an $ij\bar{a}za$ (p. 6). In a different context, after outlining the chains of transmission of his teachers back to the Shahīd al-thānī (d. 966/1558), al-Tustarī discusses whether this is sufficient or whether they should be connected back to the Shaykh al-Ṭūsī (p. 103). He explains that whatever has been fixed in writing is to be considered 'uninterrupted' (musnad), and it is only pious usage and the blessings attached to it that make it advisable to trace the chains further back to al-Tūsī.

It is typical for text-independent $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$ to be issued for the entire legacy of the school tradition. Al-Tustarī discusses the scope of the licence on two occasions. In his introduction he states that the two recipients had asked him for a licence to transmit his writings as well as the writings of earlier Imami scholars in the field of legal sciences, particularly hadīth (fī funūn al-sulūm al-shar'iyya siyyamā 'ilm al-hadīth) (p. 4). In the main section of the $ij\bar{a}za$, he greatly widens the field, including in fact the entire written legacy of Imamism. Here he states that he is issuing a general licence (ÿāza 'āmma) for everything he has the right to transmit, be it following participation in a samā', reading out to a shaykh or on the grounds of an ÿāza (samā'an wa-qirā'atan wa-ijāzatan), in the fields of traditions, tafsīr and tajwīd, law, theology and legal methodology as well as for all other writings of earlier Imami scholars in the various disciplines and subsections, in the rational sciences as well as the sciences based on revelation (pp. 58–59).

In the document under discussion a number of other features may be seen that are typical for text-independent $y\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$. Besides other functions, $y\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$ always present self-testimonies, insofar as their issuers claim, either implicitly or explicitly, the right to transmit certain subjects of knowledge that they now confer on the $muy\bar{a}z$. When the $muy\bar{a}z$ grants a permit of transmission for his own works, his right to do so is self-evident and does not need any further comment. When the permit extends to texts by other authors, however, the $muy\bar{a}z$ usually identifies those who have transmitted the knowledge to him, in greater or lesser detail. Often a $muy\bar{a}z$ indicates his social rank within the scholarly tradition he belongs to. In the case of comprehensive $y\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$, composed for the most part by prominent scholars at the height of their careers, the authors apparently seek to strengthen their own eminent position within their professional circle, a core element normally being their autobibliography. Al-Tustarī begins the

main section of his $ij\bar{a}za$ with a detailed list of his own works, containing 32 titles, that the recipients are authorized to transmit.²⁷ In many instances, he gives further information about the contents²⁸ and the occasion and date of compilation of the respective titles.²⁹ When he composed a work for others, he mentions where the autograph is located.³⁰ At times he notes that a work (usually glosses) is written in an unorganized manner.31 The general phrase at the beginning of the list of works,32 as well as the precise information about the individual titles, indicate that al-Tustarī intended to present a complete list.³³

As far as the overall structure of the $ij\bar{a}za$ is concerned, al-Tustarī follows the characteristic pattern of such documents. A short opening

 $^{^{27}}$ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, pp. 50–57. Cf. Appendix II. 28 Nos. 1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 16, 17, 18, 23. 29 Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15. Nos. 6, 9, 10.

³¹ No. 20: ḥawāshī ghayr mudawwana 'alā....

³² Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 50: qad ajaztu li-l-shaykhayn . . . an yarwiyā 'annī jamī' mā yasiḥḥu isnāduhu ilayya mimmā naṭaqa bihi fammī aw khaṭṭahu qalamī mimmā waffaqanī Allāh Subhānahu lahū min al-kutub al-mabsūta wa-l-mukhtasara wa-hiya...

³³ One reason for the discrepancy between the number of titles quoted and the total of al-Tustarī's works might be that he wrote some works only after the *yāza* was issued. Āghā Buzurg lists the following writings of al-Tustarī that are not mentioned in the autobibliographical list: Ijāza li-'ulamā' al-Ḥuwayza (Tabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 458). It is likely that this title refers to the Ijāza al-kabīra; Tashtīr wasīlat al-fawz wa-l-āmān [fī madh sāhib al-zamān 'alayhi al-salām] (Dharī'a, vol. 4, p. 191 no. 949, vol. 16, pp. 373–74 no. 1733); Khitām al-kalām fī sharh mafātīh al-aḥkām (Dharī'a, vol. 7, p. 140 no. 768), being a commentary on the introduction and the second volume of Sharḥ mafātīḥ al-aḥkām by al-Fayḍ al-Kāshānī. Since al-Tustarī states in his ijāza kabīra that he composed a commentary on the same work, entitled Dhukhr al-rā'î fī sharḥ mafātīḥ al-sharā'î consisting of one volume only, both titles may either refer to the same commentary or represent indeed two commentaries on the same work; al-Rumhiyya (Dhañ'a, vol. 11, p. 248 no. 1520; see also vol. 20, p. 114 no. 2175; GALS, vol. 2, p. 586); al-Su'āl wa-l-jawāb (Dharī'a, vol. 12, p. 246 no. 1615; see also vol. 20, p. 114 no. 2175); al-Lawh al-mahfūz fī dư ā' al-sihr (Dharī a, vol. 18, p. 376 no. 524); Risāla fī mā yajibu 'alā l-insān (Dharī'a, vol. 19, p. 34 no. 177); Dīwān Faqīr al-Jazā'irī (Dharī'a, vol. 9 iii, p. 842 no. 5635); Mu'tarak al-magāl fī 'ilm al-rijāl (Dharī'a, vol. 21, p. 210 no. 4651); al-Maqfal fi l-ad'iya wa-l-ahrāz (Dharī'a, vol. 22, p. 118 no. 6344).—Āghā Buzurg also mentions the following translations of al-Tustarī from Arabic into Persian: Tanamat al-Taṣrīf al-zanjāniyya (Dharī'a, vol. 4, p. 89 no. 394); Tarjamat Hadīyat al-mu'minīn ilā l-fārisiyya, a translation of a work by his grandfather on law, completed on 3 Muharram 1173/26 August 1759 (Dharī'a, vol. 4, p. 147 no. 715). As was mentioned above, this autobibliography is the second list of writings provided by the author; he had included a list of his writings in his Tadhkira-i <u>Shūshtar</u> (pp. 60–61) completed four years before the issuance of the $i\bar{q}\bar{a}za$. All titles mentioned in the Tadhkira are also included in the autobibliographical list in his ijāza.

prayer (p. 2) is followed by the introduction (pp. 2-4) containing the characteristic elements, including information about the issuer of the $ij\bar{a}za$ and the two recipients, as well as details about the meeting between $muj\bar{\imath}z$ and $muj\bar{a}z\bar{a}n$ and the issuing of the document. The structure of the main section of the $ij\bar{a}za$ —introduced by the characteristic demarcator qad ajaztu li-l-shaykhayn...an yarwiyā 'annī (p. 50) is also typical. In addition to authorizing transmission of his own works, al-Tustarī confers on the recipients the licence to transmit everything he himself has heard from or read to his shaykhs. This sets up the framework for the following portions of the $ij\bar{a}za$. Al-Tustarī first discusses his different shaykhs, introducing each with the typical formula wa-ajaztu lahumā . . . riwāyat jamī marwiyyātī . . . 'an . . . (pp. 58–59), . . . jamī mā sahha lī riwāyatuhu bi-l-ijāza al-amma an . . . (p. 83) and ... mā rawaytuhu bi-l-ijāzāt al-'āmma 'an ... (p. 95). Proceeding from the list of his shaykhs and their transmitters, al-Tustarī then draws a comprehensive network of Twelver Shi'i scholars with countless chains of transmission covering more than a century, from the time of his grandfather Ni^cmat Allāh al-Jazā'irī (d. 1112/1701)³⁴ back to the Shahīd al-thānī. In addition, he indicates three chains of transmission connecting the Shahīd al-thānī back to the Shaykh al-Tūsī (ch. 12).

Al-Tustarī employs various terms typically used to structure and shorten the presentation of chains of transmission, such as haylūla as an indicator of an alternative isnād element (pp. 69, 79, 87, 92, 93, 94). Furthermore, he uses expressions that are typically employed when the isnād fans out: li-l-wālid turuq mutaʿaddida wa-ahammuhā tarīqān . . . (p. 67), wa-ghayrihimā min al-falāsifa wa-l-mantiqiyyīn . . . (p. 72), 'an 'iddat min aṣḥābihi minhum . . . (pp. 67, 78, 86). In his discussion of his own shaykhs, he restricts himself to the most important

³⁴ For him cf. Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 785–89; idem, *Muṣaffā al-maqāl*, pp. 483–84; al-Khwānsārī, *Rawdāt*, vol. 8, p. 150; al-Qummī, *Fawā'id*, p. 694; al-Baḥrānī, *Lu'lu'at al-Baḥrayn*, p. 111; *Tadhkira-i Shūṣhtar*, pp. 56–59; GALS, vol. 2, p. 586. For a commented translation of Ni'mat Allāh's autobiography, that he appended to his *al-Anwār al-nu'māniyya* as an epilogue (Tabriz 1958–62, vol. 4, pp. 302–26), see Devin Stewart, "The Humor of the Scholars. The Autobiography of Ni'mat Allāh al-Jazā'irī (d. 1112/1701)," *Iranian Studies* 22 (1989), pp. 47–81. A Persian rendering of the autobiography was included in *Qiṣaṣ al-'ulamā'* by Muḥammad b. Sulaymān Tūṇakābunī which was summarized by Edward G. Browne in *A Literary History of Persia. Volume IV*, Cambridge 1924, pp. 361–67; reprinted in *The Most Leaned of the Shi'a. The Institution of the Marja' Taqlid*, ed. Linda S. Walbridge, Oxford 2001, pp. 17–20.

teachers, as he could not possibly mention all his transmitters in the limited space available.³⁵ Another common way of avoiding lengthy presentations of *isnāds* used here is to refer to licences of previous scholars where these are fully presented, or to biographical works containing such information.³⁶ Al-Tustarī refers to the *Wasā'il al-shī'a* of al-Ḥurr al-'Āmilī (d. 1104/1693) and to the *ÿāzāt* of other scholars containing detailed descriptions of their respective chains of transmission,³⁷ to the *Ghawālī al-la'ālī* of Ibn Abī Jumhūr al-Aḥṣā'ī (d. after 906/1501) for his seven chains of transmission,³⁸ to the *ÿāzāt* of Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī (d. 1110/1699 or 1111/1700), some of which are contained in the last volume of his *Biḥār al-anwār*,³⁹ as well as to the *ÿāzāt* of his teacher Naṣr Allāh b. al-Ḥusayn al-Mūsawī al-Hā'irī, particularly those collected in his *Salāsil al-dhahab*.⁴⁰

The end of the $ij\bar{a}za$ is also characteristic: Al-Tustarī mentions the conditions attached to the licence, introduced by the formula fa-l- $yarw\bar{u}$ 'annī wa-l- $yuj\bar{u}z\bar{u}$ $m\bar{a}$ $sh\bar{a}$ ' \bar{u} wa-li-man $sh\bar{a}$ ' \bar{u} bi- $shar\bar{a}$ 'iith \bar{a} al-ma' $l\bar{u}ma$ $ladayhim\bar{a}$. . . (p. 212). The document finishes with a dated colophon by the author (p. 215).

In addition to the text-immanent structure with its characteristic demarcators, and in contrast to most other comparable documents of this genre, al-Tustarī refines the textual structure by further subdividing the document into seventeen chapters. The criteria for this division correspond with its internal structure which is characteristic for $i\bar{\eta}\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$. In the main section of the document, al-Tustarī reserves

35 Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 59: . . . bi-ṭuruqī al-muttaṣila ilā muṣannifîhā wa-hiya kathīra yaṭūlu ḥaṣruhā fi hādha l-mawḍi fa-qtaṣiru ʿalā l-muhimm minhā.

³⁶ Cf. for example the *ijāza* issued by al-Shahīd al-thānī for Husayn b. 'Abd al-Samad in Jumādā II 941/December 1534–January 1535 (*Rasā'il al-Shahīd al-thānī*, vol. 2, pp. 1139–40) or the *ijāza* issued by al-Shahīd al-thānī for 'Alī b. al-Ṣā'igh al-Ḥusaynī al-Mūsawī in Jumādā I 958/May-June 1551 (*Rasā'il al-Shahīd al-thānī*, vol. 2, p. 1153).

³⁷ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 69: wa-baqiyat ṭuruq al-shaykh Muḥammad maʿrūfa mutafarriqa fī ijāzāt al-mutaʾakhkhirīn wa-qad istawfā muhimmātihā fī khātimat kitābihi Wasāʾil al-shīʿa.
38 Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 80: . . . ilā ākhir al-asānīd al-madhkūra fī awwal Kītāb Ghawālī al-laʾālī. For an analysis of Ibn Abī Jumhūr's chains of transmission, cf. my Theologie, Philosophie und Mystik, pp. 282–306.

³⁹ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 80: wa-baqiyat turuq al-Majlisī mutafarriqa fī ijāzatihi wa-majmū'a fī l-mujallad al-akhīr min Biḥār al-anwār.

⁴⁰ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 94: wa-l-sayyid Naṣr Allāh turuq ukhar mutafarriqa fī ijāzātihi wa-majmū'at muhimmātihi fī Kītābihi Salāsil al-dhahab. Cf. also Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 12, p. 211 no. 1397.—For Naṣr Allāḥ al-Ḥā'irī, cf. Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 775–79.

⁴¹ He announces this in the introduction (p. 4): wa-dhālika fī 'iddat fuṣūl.

a separate chapter for his autobibliography, which he places at the beginning of the main section (ch. 5). He also has separate chapters for his two main transmitters—his father Nūr al-Dīn (d. 1158/1745) and Naṣr Allāh al-Ḥā'irī (chs. 6 and 9). His remaining three transmitters—Muḥammad Ḥusayn b. Muḥammad Ṣāliḥ b. 'Abd al-Wāsi' al-Ḥusaynī al-Khātūn Ābādī (d. 1151/1739),⁴² Raḍī al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. 'Alī b. Ḥaydar al-'Āmilī al-Makkī (d. 1168/1754–55)⁴³ and Ṣadr al-Dīn b. Muḥammad Bāqir al-Raḍawī al-Qummī (d. 1165/1751–52)⁴⁴—are dealt with in one single chapter (ch. 11). In addition, al-Tustarī structures his elaboration on the transmitters of his teachers by dividing it into chapters. One entire chapter (ch. 7) is devoted to the transmitters of his father, another (ch. 8) to the transmitters of the latter's *shaykh* and father, Ni'mat Allāh al-Jazā'irī. The chains of transmission of Naṣr Allāh al-Ḥā'irī are also given a separate chapter (ch. 10).

A further characteristic of this $ij\bar{a}za$ that sets it apart from comparable documents may be found in the numerous theoretical reflections of the author. These can be observed throughout the entire document, i.e., not only in those parts that are typical for $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$, but also in the biographical section of the document.

Following the introduction (pp. 2–4), al-Tustarī adds three chapters in which he deals with theoretical aspects of the genre $i\bar{j}\bar{a}za$ and with the typical structure of Imami chains of transmission. In Chapter One (pp. 5–6) he treats grammatical and etymological aspects of the genre and discusses the function of issuing licences to transmit (cf. above). Chapter 2 (pp. 7–9) deals with the admissibility of transmission by means of licences and with the question of its relative significance in comparison with other ways of transmission, particularly the $sam\bar{a}$. Pointing out the widespread usage of issuing $ij\bar{a}z\bar{a}t$ in the past as well as the present, al-Tustarī concludes that the admissibility of transmission on the basis of licences is beyond doubt.

1407/[1986–87], p. 125; Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 198–200.

⁴³ For him cf. al-Qazwīnī, *Tatmīm*, p. 208; Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 275–77; Ḥasan Ṣadr, *Takmilat amal al-āmil*, ed. Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī, Beirut 1407/1986, pp. 208–10 no. 180.

⁴² For him cf. al-Qummī, Fawā'id, p. 494; al-Khwānsārī, Rawḍāt, vol. 2, p. 360; 'Abd al-Nabī al-Qazwīnī, Tatmīm amal al-āmil, ed. Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī, Qum 1407/[1986-87] p. 125; Āghā Buzurg Tahaaāt vol. 6, pp. 198-200

⁴⁴ For him cf. al-Qummī, *Fawā'id*, p. 213; idem, *al-Kunā wa-l-alqāb* 1–3, ed. Riḍā al-Mukhtārī, Qum 1422/2001, vol. 2, p. 375; al-Khwānsārī, *Rawḍāt*, vol. 4, p. 122; Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 382–84.

Chapters Three (pp. 10–12) and Four (pp. 13–49) contain an analytical presentation of typical Imami chains of transmission. Al-Tustarī opens this section with a quote from the $ij\bar{a}za$ from Hasan b. al-Shahīd al-thānī (d. 1011/1607) for Najm al-Dīn b. Muḥammad al-Husaynī and his sons Muhammad and 'Alī in which Hasan subdivides the Imami chains of transmission into three periods, ranked around the following three leading scholars: Shaykh al-Tūsī, al-Shahīd al-awwal (d. 786/1384) and al-Shahīd al-thānī. 45 Al-Tustarī agrees with this division in principle, but points out that within the respective periods there are countless transmitters to be referred to for the chain of transmission to be valid. In the following Chapter Four (pp. 13–49) al-Tustarī provides a list of 129 scholars in chronological order, starting with the second period (pp. 13-17) and continuing into the third period (pp. 17-19). He then continues the principle laid down by Hasan b. al-Shahīd al-thānī by labeling the period since the passing away of the Shahīd al-thānī the fourth period.46 Here he provides a list of scholars belonging to this epoch, again in chronological order and subdivided into five generations. Each generation, states al-Tustarī at the end of this section, transmits from the former generation without any interruption or incompleteness in the chain of transmission. 47 Exceptions to this rule occur only insofar as some scholars granted each other licences to transmit, so-called 'honorary' ijāzas (ijāza mudabbaja) (pp. 47-49). This term is used when two equal and usually reputed scholars grant each other the right to transmit.⁴⁸

⁴⁵ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, pp. 10–11. The $y\bar{a}za$ of Hasan b. al-Shahīd al-thānī is included in al-Majlisī, $Bih\bar{a}r$ al-anwār, vol. 109, pp. 3–79; the passage al-Tustarī quotes is to be found on pp. 5–6.

⁴⁶ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, pp. 19ff.: al-martaba al-rābi'a al-muta' akhkhira 'an 'aṣr al-Shahīd al-thānī ilā 'aṣrinā hādha.

⁴⁷ Al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 47: . . . yarwī kull ṭabaqa 'an al-ṭabaqa al-sābiqa muttaṣilan musal-salan mu'an'anan lā yukhālijuhu qaṭ' wa-lā irsāl wa-lā ghayr min wujūh al-khadsh wa-l-ikhtilāl.

⁴⁸ Al-Tustarī mentions the following scholars as examples of those who granted each other licences to transmit: Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī and Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan al-Ḥurr al-ʿĀmilī (d. 1104/1693) and Ṣadr al-Dīn 'Alī Khān b. Nizām al-Dīn Aḥmad (1052/1642–3–1119/1707–8); Niʿmat Allāh al-Jazāʾirī and Ḥusayn b. Muḥyī al-Dīn b. 'Abd al-Laṭīf al-Jāmiʿī (see also *Dharīʿa*, vol. 1, p. 259 no. 1364); and al-Tustarī himself and Naṣr Allāh b. al-Ḥusayn al-Ḥāʾirī. Cf. al-Ijāza al-kabīra, p. 49. For further examples, see Āghā Buzurg, *Dharīʿa*, vol. 1, p. 159 no. 789 (*yjāza* granted by Mīrzā Muḥammad Bāqir b. Mīrzā Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn al-Mūsawī al-Khwānsārī al-Iṣfahānī to Qāsim b. Muḥammad al-Najafī in 1268/1851–52), pp. 192–93 no. 997 (*yjāza* granted by Muḥammad Rafīʿ b. 'Abd al-Muḥammad al-Kawārī al-Kazāzī to 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. Muḥammad al-Karharūdī al-Sulṭān Ābādī),

Al-Tustarī restricts himself as a rule to their respective names. Only rarely does he add further information, as in cases when a scholar belongs to more than one generation of transmitters (pp. 34, 37) or when he deems it necessary further to identify a person in order to avoid confusion (pp. 14, 25, 47).

Another theoretical block is to be found at the end of the document, where al-Tustarī discusses in detail the conditions that are attached to receiving a licence (pp. 212-15).

Al-Tustarī considers the documentation of the scholarly tradition to be of prime significance. Towards the end of the document, he adds four chapters dealing with his contemporaries, all of whom, except for one, he had met personally. While al-Tustarī shares the interest of documenting his own scholarly tradition with compilers of comparable documents, the biographical section of the $ij\bar{a}za$ does not consist of digressions within the main section of the licence, as was the case, e.g., with 'Abd Allāh al-Samāhījī's (d. 1135/1722) *Ijāza* kabīra to Nāṣir al-Jārūdī al-Qaṭīfī⁴⁹ and other comparable ÿāzas of this size at the time. 50 Rather, al-Tustarī strictly differentiates between the main section of the *ijāza* and the following independent biographical section (chs. 13-16) that is clearly separated from the preceding section (chs. 5–12) by an introduction (ch. 13).⁵¹ Moreover, even within the biographical section, al-Tustarī presents his material in a systematic and well-structured manner. In the introduction to the biographical section he untertakes a critical evaluation of the Rijāl-works that were compiled since the time of the Shaykh al-Tūsī. He criticizes in particular the fact that the authors provided a very incomplete documentation of the earlier generations of scholars. Moreover, since the last Imami biographical work, the Amal al-āmil by al-Hurr al-'Āmilī (d. 1104/1693) was completed—for which al-Tustarī has the highest respect and in the tradition of which he seeks to put himself⁵²—seventy years have passed that have so far remained

p. 205 no. 1071 (*yjāza* granted by 'Abd Allāh al-Samāhījī to Nāṣir al-Jārūdī in 1128/1716); p. 256 no. 1350 ($ij\bar{a}za$ granted by 'Abd al-Nabī al-Qazwīnī to Baḥr al-'Ulūm), p. 266 no. 1394 ($ij\bar{a}za$ granted by Yūsuf b. Aḥmad al-Baḥrānī to 'Abd Allāh al-Bilādī al-Baḥrānī).

 ⁴⁹ Cf. my "The ÿāza," pp. 73–75.
 50 See Gleave, "The Ijāza," pp. 117–22.

Later authors, such as Muhsin al-Amīn, designate this part of the $ij\bar{a}za$ as an appendix to it, Dhayl al-ijāza al-kabīra.

Āghā Buzurg accordingly designates al-Tustarī's ijāza as takmila to al-Hurr al-Āmilī's Amal al-āmil; cf. Muṣaffā al-maqāl, p. 246.—For Amal al-āmil, see Marco Salati,

undocumented. In the subsequent chapter 14, al-Tustarī discusses a total of 65 scholars he had met during his lifetime, all of whom are from the Khūzistān area. The respective entries, which are arranged alphabetically by name, 53 as a rule contain a general appreciation of the scholar under discussion, information on the circumstances under which al-Tustarī met him, sometimes even providing exact dates, the transmitters and teachers of the respective scholar, his writings and other biographical details.⁵⁴ The majority of the scholars treated here—55 out of 65—had already passed away before the compilation of the *ijāza* in 1168/1755.55 Al-Tustarī frequently indicates the decade of their death,56 at times even the exact year.57 In five cases he has no information on the date of death.⁵⁸ Eight scholars out of 65 are still alive in 1168/175559 and with regard to two persons he is uncertain. 60—Al-Tustarī further dedicates an extensive chapter to 'Abd Allāh al-Samāhījī, whom he had never met personally, but whose writings he had found useful (ch. 16).

Within the biographical section of the document a further theoretical portion is to be found. After al-Tustarī writes in detail about 65 of his contemporaries in chapter 14, he untertakes an overall evaluation of those scholars. His judgement is rather negative. The majority of the scholars, he states, did not pass the stage of mere imitation $(taql\bar{\iota}d)$ and even those to whom this does not apply did not proceed far compared to the scholars of the former generations.

[&]quot;I maestri e le catene di trasmissione dell'insegnamento orale nel *Ğabal 'āmil*," in *Onomastica e trasmissione del sapere nell'Islam medievale*, ed. Biancamaria Scarcia Amoretti, Rome 1992, pp. 91–110; Josef van Ess, "Amal al-āmel," in *Encyclopaedia Iranica*, vol. 1, pp. 917–18.

There are only three exceptions to this rule in the edition of Muḥammad al-Samāmī al-Ḥa'irī (nos. 10, 19, 46), all of which are to be attributed to the editor and were not intended by the author of the $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$; no. 10 is in fact part of the entry no. 9, the father of no. 10; no. 19 belongs to entry no. 18, the brother of no. 19; no. 46 is part of the entry no. 45, the brother of no. 46.

⁵⁴ Cf. Appendix I.

⁵⁵ Nos. 1, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 35, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 47, 48, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68.

Nos. 1, 8, 9, 11, 15, 18, 20, 22, 25, 27, 29, 30, 40, 45, 48, 59, 64, 66, 67, 68.
 Nos. 4, 14, 21, 24, 26, 32, 33, 35, 37, 38, 39, 41, 42, 44, 52, 53, 54, 55, 57,
 33.

 $^{^{58}}$ Nos. 5, 17, 28, 51, 65. The information provided by the author on the dates of death of nos. 6, 16, 23, 31, 43, 50, 58 is also rather vague.

⁵⁹ Nos. 2, 3, 12, 34, 36, 49, 60, 62.

⁶⁰ Nos. 7, 61.

According to al-Tustarī, this did not result from their inability to reach a higher level but rather from the circumstances in times of political turmoil and civil war, poverty and a general disregard for knowledge and its transmission, as well as for scholars in general. These difficulties, which, al-Tustarī explains, are by no means restricted to religious scholars but apply also to philosophers and physicians, are characteristic of the chaotic circumstances in Iran following the fall of the Safavids in 1722. As an example of the favorable circumstances earlier generations were able to enjoy, al-Tustarī mentions the support Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī received from the Safavid rulers when collecting material for his *Biḥār al-anwār* (pp. 197–98).

3

The significance of the $i\bar{j}\bar{a}za$ discussed here lies in two areas. On the one hand, the document is of prime historical value for the reconstruction of the Imami scholarly network of the 18th century. This applies to the information on the father and grandfather of al-Tustarī, the four recipients of the $i\bar{j}\bar{a}za$ and in particular the 65 contemporaries of al-Tustarī dealt with in the biographical section of the document. The historical significance of al-Tustarī's $i\bar{j}\bar{a}za$ becomes apparent when one compares his information with later biographical literature. In most cases al-Tustarī's $i\bar{j}\bar{a}za$ was the only, in some the main source for the respective biographical entries. Significance of the numerous

⁶¹ For the Imami scholarly network of 18th century Iraq and Iran, cf. Said Amir Arjomand, The Shadow of God and the Hidden Imam. Religion, Political Order, and Societal Change in Shi'ite Iran from the Beginning to 1890, Chicago 1984; Juan R.I. Cole, "Shi'i Clerics in Iraq and Iran, 1722–1780. The Akhbari-Usuli Conflict Reconsidered," Iranian Studies 18 i (1985), pp. 3–34; idem, "Ideology, Ethics, and Philosophical Discourse in Eighteenth Century Iran," Iranian Studies 22 i (1989), pp. 7–34.—In general for the political and societal situation in Iran during the 18th century, cf. Laurence Lockhart, Nadir Shah. A Critical Study Based Mainly Upon Contemporary Sources, London 1938; idem, The Fall of the Safavi Dynasty and the Afghan Occupation of Persia, Cambridge 1958; John Perry, Karim Khan Zand, Chicago 1973; Roger Savory, Iran under the Safavids, Cambridge 1980; Hans Robert Roemer, Persien auf dem Weg in die Neuzeit. Iranische Geschichte von 1350–1750, Beirut 1989, J. Foran, Fragile Resistance. Social Transformation in Iran from 1500 to the Revolution, Boulder/San Francisco/Oxford 1993.

 $^{^{62}}$ Such is the case with nos. 1, 3, 5, 8, 10, 12, 13, 15, 16, 19, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 31, 32, 33, 34, 36, 37, 38, 41, 43, 44, 45.—This also applies for persons

self-testimonies and autobiographical and autobibliographical information it contains, the $i\bar{y}\bar{a}za$ is also a rich source of information on al-Tustarī's own life.

For our understanding of the genre of $y\bar{a}za$, particularly the typology of its forms and analysis of its functions, the significance of the present document lies, moreover, in its being an apparently exceptional case within this genre. Finally, the numerous theoretical reflections it contains provide valuable information on the social practice of issuing licences to transmit in the 18th century, which still remains to be fully explored.*

Appendix I: Contemporary scholars, whom the mujīz met in the course of his life (ch. 14)

The numbering of the following list matches that introduced by the editor of the text. In square brackets are those scholars that are given separate numbers by the editor although the author himself mentioned them only as a digression within another entry without dedicating a separate entry to them. In round brackets is indicated the approximate date of death as given by al-Tustarī. In case this information could be further specified on the basis of later sources, the exact year of death is mentioned in square brackets.

- 1. Ibrāhīm b. 'Alī b. Bālīl al-Jazā'irī al-Dawraqī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-khamsīn)
 - (Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 6)
- 2. Ibrāhīm b. Muḥammad Bāqir al-Qummī al-Raḍawī al-Najafī al-Hamadānī (alive in 1168/1755)

(al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 2, p. 204; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 14,

whom the author mentions without dedicating a specific entry to them; cf., e.g., *al-Ijāza al-kabīra*, p. 155, where he mentions a certain Shaykh Muḥammad, with whom he studied under 'Alī al-Ṭāliqānī (= no. 38). Cf. Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 638; Āghā Buzurg identifies him on the basis of Tustarī's information as Muḥammad al-Tamāmī al-Jazā'irī al-Shīrāzī (= no. 50). For him, cf. Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 649–50. Cf. also *al-Ijāza al-kabīra*, p. 191, where Fakhr al-Dīn al-Shūshtarī is mentioned as teacher of no. 67. Cf. also Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 581.— For the significance of this *ÿāza* as a historical source, see also ibid, vol. 6, p. 457.

^{*} I take the opportunity to thank Rainer Brunner, Etan Kohlberg, Gudrun Krämer, Elizabeth Pond, and Reza Pourjavady who read drafts of this paper and made helpful suggestions.

- p. 74; al-Qazwīnī, Tatmīm, p. 56 no. 6; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 18-19)
- 3. Abū Ja'far al-Māzandarānī (alive in 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 2, p. 316; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 142-43)
- 4. Abu l-Ḥasan b. Muḥammad Zamān b. ʿInāyat Allāh al-Tustarī (d. 1143/1730), brother of no. 39 (*Tadhkira*, p. 157)
- Abū Ṭālib b. Abi l-Ḥasan al-Fatūnī al-ʿĀmilī al-Gharawī (d. before 1168/1755) [1070/1659-60-1138/1725-26]
 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 2, p. 366; Āl Maḥbūba, Māḍī al-Najaf, vol. 3, p. 49; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 391; Ṣadr, Takmila, pp. 444-45 no. 437)
- Aḥmad b. Muḥammad Mahdī al-Khātūn Ābādī (d. after 1139/1726-27) [d. 1154/1741-42]
 (Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 34-36)
- Aḥmad al-'Alawī al-Khātūn Ābādī (d. before or after 1168/1755)
 [d. 1161/1748]
 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 3, p. 22; al-Qazwīnī, Tatmīm, pp. 60-61 no. 12; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 33-34)
- 8. Iskandar b. Jamāl al-Dīn al-Jazā'irī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-arba'īn) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 3, p. 302; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 57)
- 9. Ismā'īl al-Burūjirdī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-sittīn) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 3, p. 313; al-Qazwīnī, Tatmīm, p. 71; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 59)
- [Muḥammad b. Ismā'īl al-Burūjirdī, son of no. 9 who died shortly after his father (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 10, p. 20; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 945)]
- 11. Ismā'īl b. al-Amīr Muḥammad Bāqir al-Khātūn Ābādī (tuwuffya 'ushr al-sittīn) [d. after 1160/1747–48] (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 3, p. 402; al-Qazwīnī, Tatmīm, p. 69 no. 20; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 62)
- 12. Ja'far al-Ḥusaynī al-Harawī al-Mashhadī (alive in 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 4, p. 96)
- 13. Jamāl al-Dīn b. Iskandar b. Jamāl al-Dīn al-Jazā'irī (d. before 1168/1755), son of no. 8 (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 4, p. 206; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 146)

- 14. Ḥasan b. Ḥusayn b. Muḥyī al-Dīn b. ʿAbd al-Laṭīf al-Jāmiʿī (d. 1130/1620-21)
 (al-Amīn, Aʿyān, vol. 5, p. 57; Āl Maḥbūba, Māḍī al-Najaf, vol. 3, p. 308; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 164; Ṣadr, Takmila, pp. 147-48 no. 95)
- 15. Ḥusayn b. Ibrāhīm al-Khātūn Ābādī al-Mashhadī (tuwuffiya maqtūlan 'ushr al-sittīn) [d. 1159/1746–47] (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 5, p. 413; al-Qazwīnī, Tatmīm, pp. 128–29 no. 80; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 196–98)
- 16. Ḥusayn b. Zaʻl al-Baḥrānī (d. before 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, Aʻyān, vol. 6, p. 23; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 185–86)
- 17. Ḥaydar al-ʿĀmilī al-Mashhadī (d. before 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 6, p. 271; al-Qazwīnī, *Tatmīm*, pp. 139–41 no. 93; Ṣadr, *Takmila*, p. 195 no. 163; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 230–31)
- 18. Khamīs b. Ṣāliḥ al-Khalaf Ābādī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-sittīn) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 6, p. 357; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 246)
- 19. [his (no. 18) brother Aḥmad (alive in 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 2, p. 605; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 36)]
- 20. Rafīʻ al-Dīn (Muḥammad Rafīʻ) b. Faraj (Farrakh) al-Jīlānī al-Raḍawī al-Rashtī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-sittīn) [d. 1160/1747–48], uncle of no. 60 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 7, pp. 33–34; Qummī, Fawā'id 535; al-Qazwīnī, Tatmīm, pp. 159–61 no. 111; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 283–87)
- Zakī (Muḥammad Zakī) b. Ibrāhīm al-Kirmānshāhī (d. 1159/1746-47)
 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 7, p. 68; Āghā Buzurg, *Dharī'a*, vol. 10, p. 199; al-Qazwīnī, *Tatmīm*, pp. 166-69 no. 118; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 290-91)
- 22. Shams al-Dīn b. Ṣaqar al-Baṣrī al-Jazā'irī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-arba'īn) [ca. 1070/1659-60-1140/1727-28] (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 7, p. 352; al-Afandī, Riyād, vol. 3, p. 12; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 351)
- 23. Ṣadr al-Dīn b. al-Qāḍī Muḥammad Saʿīd al-Qummī (d. before 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, Aʿyān, vol. 7, p. 385; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 382)

- 24. 'Abd al-Bāqī b. Murtaḍā al-Mūsawī al-Dizfūlī (d. 1143/1730-31) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 7, p. 433; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 413-14)
- 25. 'Abd al-Ḥusayn al-Qārī al-Ḥuwayzī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-arba'īn) (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 412)
- 26. 'Abd al-Ḥusayn b. Kalab 'Alī al-Tustarī (d. 1141/1728—29) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 7, p. 451; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 420; Tadhkira 159)
- 27. 'Abd al-Raḥīm al-Damāwandī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-sittīn) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 7, p. 470; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 425–26)
- 28. 'Abd al-Raḥīm b. Ja'far b. Muḥammad Bāqir al-Sabzawārī (d. before 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 7, p. 470; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 426)
- 29. 'Abd al-Ghaffār b. Muḥammad Taqī al-Tustarī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-khamsīn) [d. 1147/1734-35] (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 439-40; *Tadhkira*, p. 159)
- 30. Abd Allāh b. 'Īsā al-Iṣbahānī al-mushtahir bi-l-Tabrīzī al-Afandī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-thalāthīn) [1066/1655–56–ca. 1130/1717–18] (Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, p. vol. 1, p. 127, vol. 3, p. 104, vol. 11, p. 331; idem, Muṣaffā al-maqāl, pp. 240–241; idem, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 449–52; al-Qummī, Fawā'id, p. 253; idem, al-Kunā, vol. 2, pp. 48–50; al-Kaḥḥāla, Muʿjam, vol. 6, p. 99; al-Khwānsārī, Rawdāt, vol. 4, p. 255; al-Afandī, Riyād, vol. 3, p. 230)
- 31. 'Abd Allāh b. Karam Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī (d. before 1168/1755) [alive in 1131/1718–19] (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 8, p. 68; Āl Maḥbūba, *Māḍī al-Najaf*, vol. 2, p. 184; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 459–60)
- 32. 'Abd Allāh b. Nāṣir al-Ḥuwayzī al-Ḥumaylī (d. 1143/1730-31), father of one of the recipients of the *ȳāza*, Ibrāhīm b. 'Abd Allāh b. Nāṣir al-Ḥuwayzī al-Ḥumaylī (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 471-72)
- 33. 'Abd Muḥammad b. 'Abd al-Jalīl b. al-Ḥājj 'Abd Muḥammad al-Ḥuwayzī (d. 1128/1716) (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 473)
- 34. 'Alī al-Burūjirdī al-Nahāwandī (alive in 1168/1755) (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 506)
- 35. 'Alī b. 'Azīz Allāh b. 'Abd al-Muṭallib b. Muḥammad b. al-Ḥusayn al-Mūsawī al-Jazā'irī (d. 1149/1736–37)

- 36. 'Alī b. 'Alī al-Najjār al-Tustarī (alive in 1168/1755), brother of no. 53
 - (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 558; *Tadhkira*, p. 166)
- 37. 'Alī b. Naṣr Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī al-Qāḍī (d. 1150/1737–38) (Āghā Buzurg, $Tabaq\bar{a}t$, vol. 6, p. 520)
- 38. 'Alī Akbar al-Ṭālaqānī al-Khwānsārī (d. 1160/1747–48) (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 8, p. 171; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 496–99)
- 39. Ināyat Allāh b. Muḥammad Zamān b. Ināyat Allāh al-Tustarī (d. 1146/1733-34), brother of no. 4 (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 565; *Tadhkira*, p. 160)
- 40. 'Iwad al-Ḥuwayzī al-Baṣrī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-sittīn) (Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 566)
- 41. Fatḥ Allāh b. 'Ilwān al-Dawraqī al-Ka'bī (d. 1130/1717–18) [1053/1643–44—1130/1717–18] (al-Kaḥḥāla, *Muʿjam*, vol. 8, p. 52; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 578–79)
- 42. Faraj Allāh b. Muḥammad Ḥusayn al-Tustarī (d. 1128/1716), brother of no. 57 (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 8, pp. 395–96; Āghā Buzurg, *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 583; *Tadhkira*, p. 161)
- 43. Qawām al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Muḥammad Mahdī al-Ḥusaynī al-Sayfī al-Qazwīnī (d. before 1168/1755) [d. 1150/1640-41] (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 8, p. 452; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 4, p. 100; idem, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 603-5; al-Qummī, al-Kunā, vol. 3, pp. 90-93)
- 44. Karam Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī (d. 1154/1741–42), father of one of the recipients of the *ÿāza*, Muḥammad b. Karam Allāh al-Ḥuwayzī (d. 1172/1758–59) (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 9, p. 29; Āl Maḥbūba, *Māḍī al-Najaf*, vol. 2, p. 186; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 614)
- 45. Majd al-Dīn b. Afḍal b. Fayḍ Allāh al-Dizfūlī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-khamsīn)
 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 9, p. 45; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 630)
- 46. [Muḥammad al-Mu'min al-Dizfūlī, brother of no. 45 (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 747)]
- 47. Majd al-Dīn b. Shafī' al-Dīn b. Faṣīḥ al-Dīn al-'Abbāsī al-Qathamī al-Dizfūlī (d. after 1060/1747–48) [d. before 1165/1751–52]

- (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 9, p. 45; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 630–31)
- 48. Muḥsin b. Jān Aḥmad al-Dizfūlī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-khamsīn) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 9, p. 45; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 633)
- 49. Muḥammad b. Aḥmad al-Jazā'irī al-Gharawī (alive in 1168/1755) [alive in 1182/1768–69] (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 9, p. 71; al-Qummī, Fawā'id, p. 386; Āl Maḥbūba, Māḍī al-Najaf, vol. 2, p. 92; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 653–54)
- Muḥammad al-Tamāmī al-Jazā'irī al-Shīrāzī (d. after 1158/1745-46)
 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 9, p. 198; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 649-50, also pp. 508-9)
- 51. Muḥammad al-Ṭabāṭabā'ī, nephew of Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī (d. before 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 9, p. 376; al-Qummī, Fawā'id, p. 552)
- 52. Muḥammad b. al-Ḥājj ʿAlī b. al-Amīr Maḥmūd al-Jazāʾirī al-Tustarī (d. 1130/1717–18) [d. 1131/1718–19] (al-Amīn, Aʿyān, vol. 10, p. 9; Āghā Buzurg, Tabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 652–53)
- Muḥammad b. 'Alī al-Najjār al-Tustarī (d. 1140/1727–28), brother of no. 36
 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 10, p. 9; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 706–7; Tadhkira, p. 161)
- 54. Muḥammad b. Fatḥ 'Alī b. Muḥammad al-Tustarī (d. 1163/1750) (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 677; *Tadhkira*, p. 168)
- 55. Muḥammad b. Muḥammad Ṣāliḥ b. 'Abd al-Wāsi' al-Ḥusaynī al-Khātūn Ābādī (d. 1148/1735—36) (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 664—65)
- 56. Muḥammad Bāqir b. Fakhr al-Dīn b. Nūr al-Dīn al-ʿĀmilī al-Dizfūlī (d. after 1160/1747–48) (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 90; Ṣadr, *Takmila*, p. 377 no. 365)
- 57. Muḥammad Bāqir b. Muḥammad Ḥusayn al-Tustarī (d. 1135/1722-23), brother of no. 42 (al-Amīn, Ayān, vol. 9, p. 187; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 91; Tadhkira, p. 162)
- 58. Muḥammad Taqī al-'Alawī al-Riḍā Tawfīqī (d. before 1168/1755) [alive in 1138/1725–26] (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 118)

- 59. Muḥammad Riḍā b. Muḥammad Hādī b. Muḥammad Ṣāliḥ al-Ṭabarastānī al-Māzandarānī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-khamsīn) (Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 268)
- 60. Muḥammad 'Alī b. Muḥammad Shafī' al-Jīlānī (alive in 1168/1755), nephew of no. 20
 (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 534-35)
- Muḥammad Qāsim b. Muḥammad Ṣādiq al-Astarābādī (d. before or after 1168/1755)
 (al-Amīn, Ayān, vol. 10, p. 40; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 588)
- 62. Muḥammad Mahdī b. Muḥammad Ṣāliḥ al-Aftūnī (al-Fatūnī) (alive in 1168/1755) [d. 1183/1769–70] (al-Amīn, *A'yān*, vol. 10, p. 67; Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 756–58; Ṣadr, *Takmila*, pp. 392–93 no. 379)
- 63. Muḥammad Hādī b. Muḥammad b. 'Īsā al-Mar'ashī al-Tustarī (d. 1138/1725–26) [d. 1137/1724–25] (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 806–7)
- 64. Maḥmūd b. Muḥammad al-Ḥuwayzī al-Dizfūlī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-khamsīn) [d. after 1150/1737–38] (Āghā Buzurg, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, p. 712)
- 65. Manṣūr b. Muḥammad b. 'Abd al-Ḥusayn al-Ḥusaynī al-Najafī al-Ṭālaqānī (d. before 1168/1755) (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 10, p. 141; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 743)
- 66. Mahdī b. Nu'aym al-Iṣfahānī al-'Uqaylī al-Astarābādī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-sittīn)
 (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 10, pp. 166–67; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 761, also pp. 790–91)
- 67. Nazar 'Alī b. Muḥammad Amīn al-Zajjāj al-Tustarī (tuwuffya 'ushr al-khamsīn) [d. 1146/1733—34] (al-Amīn, A'yān, vol. 10, pp. 222—23; Tadhkira, p. 163; Āghā Buzurg, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, p. 784)
- 68. Yaʻqūb b. Ibrāhīm al-Bakhtiyārī al-Ḥuwayzī (tuwuffiya 'ushr al-khamsīn) [d. 1147/1734—35] (al-Amīn, Aʻyān, vol. 10, p. 307; Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʻa, vol. 2, p. 222, vol. 3, p. 374, vol. 6, p. 63; idem, Ṭabaqāt, vol. 6, pp. 821—23; al-Kaḥḥāla, Muʻjam, vol. 13, p. 240; Tadhkira, p. 163)

Appendix II: Autobibliographical list (ch. 5)

The wording of each title corresponds to the wording in the $ij\bar{a}za$. In square brackets are mentioned alternative titles listed either by al-Tustarī in his Tadhkira-i $Sh\bar{u}shtar$ (pp. 60–61) or by later authors. The sequence of the titles corresponds to the sequence in which they appear in the $ij\bar{a}za$; the numbering corresponds to the numbering introduced by the editor. Only in the case of no. 20 has the entry been further subdivided. In addition to other references, the respective number of each title in the author's autobibliographical list in Tadhkira-i $Sh\bar{u}shtar$ is also indicated.

- Risāla mukhtaṣara fī 'ilm al-naḥw [= Madīnat al-naḥw min mutūn aljāmi'a li-masā'ilihi ka-l-lāfiyya wa-l-tahdhīb wa-ghayruhumā] (Tadhkira no. 1; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 20, p. 254 no. 2835, vol. 24, p. 86)
- 2. Ḥāshiyya mudawwana 'alā Kitāb arba'īn ḥadīthan Commentary on al-Arba'īn ḥadīthan of Bahā' al-Dīn al-'Āmilī (d. 1030/1620–21 or 1031/1621–22) (Tadhkira no. 2; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 1, pp. 425–26 no. 2180, vol. 6, p. 13 no. 35; written at the request of his father and completed in 1135/1722–23)
- 3. Risāla fārisiyya fī taḥqīq qiblat baladinā [Tustar] [= Risāla fī qiblat Tustar wa-mā wālāhā/Risāla dar taḥqīq-i qibla-yi Shūshtar/Taḥqīq qiblat Tustar]
 (Tadhkira no. 3; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 17, pp. 44–45 no. 238; see also vol. 20, p. 114 no. 2175; composed following the order of Isfindiyār Beg on 7 Şafar 1140/23 September 1727)
- 4. Risāla ukhrā fī hādhā l-bāb [= Risāla dar taḥqīq-i qibla-yi Ḥuwayza] (Tadhkira no. 4; Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 17, p. 45 no. 240a; composed following the order of Sayyid ʿAlī Khān b. Sayyid Mutallib, ruler of Huwayza)
- 5. Risāla mawsūma bi-l-Tuḥfa al-nūriyya (Tadhkira no. 5; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 3, p. 479 no. 1769; composed at the request of his father and named according to him; completed on 3 Muḥarram 1144/8 July 1731; in this treatise the author deals with ten questions from ten different disciplines, namely tafsīr, ḥadīth, fiqh, uṣūl, manṭiq, i'rāb, balāgha, nujūm, hay'a)
- 6. Risāla mawsūma bi-Kāshifat al-ḥāl fī ma'rifat al-qibla wa-l-zawāl (Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 17, pp. 241–42 no. 74; cf. also idem,

- *Tabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 526–27; composed following the order of the governor 'Alī Khān *al-ṣaghīr* al-Ḥuwayzī)
- 7. Risāla fārisiyya fī l-ṭilasm [al-sulṭānī fī l-hay'a wa-l-nujūm wa-l-ṭilasmāt] (Tadhkira no. 13; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 15, p. 177, vol. 15, p. 178 no. 1188; Munzawī, Fihrist, vol. 1, pp. 328–29; composed in 1157/1744–45 following the order of Abū Ṣāliḥ Sulṭān al-Tarshīzī, wakīl māliyāt Khūzistān wa-Tustar)
- 8. Risāla fī istikhrāj inḥirāf [al-qibla/Istikhrāj inḥirāf jamī al-bilād/Risāla dar taḥqīq-i ḍawābiṭ-i istikhrāj] (Taḍhkira no. 12; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī a, vol. 2, p. 20 no. 62)
- 9. Risāla mawsūma bi-Lubb al-lubāb fī sharḥ ṣaḥīfat al-usturlāb [li-l-Shaykh al-Bahā'ī (d. 1030/1621 or 1021/1622)] (Tadhkira no. 6; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 13, pp. 344–45, vol. 13, p. 361, vol. 18, p. 290 no. 149; composed at the request of his student Ibrāhīm b. 'Abd Allāh b. Nāṣir al-Ḥuwayzī)
- 10. Risāla fī l-raml
- 11. Kitāb al-Dhukhr al-rā'i [al-Maṣābīḥ al-lawāmi'] fī sharḥ Mafātīḥ al-sharā'i [li-l-Fayḍ al-Kāshānī] (Taḍhkira no. 7; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 10, p. 8 no. 47; Hossein Modarressi Tabātabā'i, An Introduction to Shī'ī Law. A bib-liographical study, London 1984, p. 86—Introduction and volume one completed in 1142/1729–30)
- 12. Risāla mawsūma bi-l-Anwār al-jaliyya fī jawābāt al-masā'il al-jabaliyya al-ūlā [Risāla-yi jabaliyya-yi ūlā] (Tadhkira no. 8; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 2, pp. 423–24 no. 1671; Modarressi, Introduction, p. 109; GALS, vol. 2, p. 586; responsa to 70 questions of Sayyid 'Alī al-Burūjirdī al-Nahāwandī [al-Masā'il al-jabaliyya], completed on 28 Jumādā I 1149/4 Oktober 1736)
- 13. Risāla ukhrā fī l-masā'il al-jabaliyya al-thāniya [= al-Dhakhīra al-bāqiya fī ajwibat al-masā'il al-jabaliyya al-thāniya/Risāla-yi jabaliyya-yi thāniya (Tadhkira no. 9; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 10, p. 15 no. 70; Modarressi, Introduction, p. 109; GALS, vol. 2, p. 586—responsa to 30 questions of Sayyid 'Alī al-Burūjirdī al-Nahāwandī [al-Masā'il al-jabaliyya], completed on 17 Sha'bān 1151/29 November 1738)
- 14. Risālat al-Maqāṣid al-ʿaliyya [al-Risāla al-ʿalawiyya] fī jawābāt [ajwibat] al-masāʾil al-ʿalawiyya [masāʾil al-Shaykh ʿAlī al-Ḥuwayzī] [al-ʿAliyya fī ajwibat al-masāʾil al-ʿAlawiyya] (Tadhkira no. 10; Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 11, p. 210; see also

- vol. 20, p. 114 no. 2175; vol. 21, pp. 381–82 no. 5565; idem, *Ṭabaqāt*, vol. 6, pp. 520–21; Modarressi, *Introduction*, p. 109; GALS, vol. 2, p. 586—responsa to 30 questions of 'Alī b. 'Abd Allāh b. Muḥammad al-Ḥuwayzānī [al-Ḥuwayzī], mostly on *fiqh*. Completed on 28 Jumādā II 1149/2 November 1736)
- 15. Risālat al-Dhakhīra al-ʿābadiyya fī jawābāt al-masā'il al-aḥmadiyya [al-Risāla al-aḥmadiyya fī jawāb masā'il al-Sayyid Aḥmad al-Mūsawī al-Musha'sha'ī] (Tadhkira no. 11; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 10, p. 12 no. 61, vol. 11, p. 37; Modarressi, Introduction, p. 109; GALS, vol. 2, p. 586—responsa to 40 questions of Aḥmad al-Ḥuwayzī al-Mūsawī al-Musha'sha'ī [al-Masā'il al-aḥmadiyya]; completed in 1155/1742-43)
- 16. Juz' min Tadhyīl [Dhayl] salāfat al-ʿaṣr (Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 4, p. 54 no. 223, vol. 12, p. 212 no. 1401)
- 17. Kītāb al-Tuḥfa al-saniyya fī sharḥ al-nukhba al-muḥsiniyya (Tadhkira no. 14; Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 3, pp. 442–43 no. 1606; Modarressi, Introduction, p. 87; GALS, vol. 2, p. 586; commentary on the Kītāb al-Nukhba of Fayḍ al-Kāshānī on fiqh, composed at the request of Mawlā ʿAlī b. ʿAlī al-Najjār al-Tustarī, a student of the father of the mujīz)
- 18. Risāla fī ṣiḥḥat ṣalāt mustaṣḥib al-dhahab al-mastūr fī l-kamm wa-naḥwahu (Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 15, p. 12 no. 57)
- 19. Ḥāshiya mudawwana 'alā [muqaddimāt] al-wāfī fī jam' aḥādīth al-kutub al-arba'a [li-l-Fayḍ al-Kāshānī] (Tadhkira no. 15; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 6, p. 229 no. 1288)
- 20a. *Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana ʿalā al-istibṣār* [li-l-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī] (Āghā Buzurg, *Dharīʿa*, vol. 6, p. 18 no. 56)
- 20b. Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana ʻalā al-Madārik [al-aḥkām fī sharḥ sharāʿiʾ al-islām li-Muḥammad b. ʻAlī sibṭ al-Shahīd al-thānī] (Tadhkira no. 17; Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 6, p. 197 no. 1085)
- 20c. Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana ʻalā [al-Rawḍa al-bahiyya] fī Sharḥ al-Lumʿa al-dimashqiyya [li-l-Shahīd al-thānī] (Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 6, p. 95 no. 502)
- 20d. Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana ʿalā Kitāb al-rijāl al-kabīr [= Manhaj al-maqāl fī ʿilm al-rijāl] li-Mīrzā Muḥammad b. ʿAlī al-Astarābādī (d. 1028/1619) (Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 6, p. 226 no. 1266)
- 20e. Hāshiya ghayr mudawwana 'alā Rijāl al-Sayyid Muṣṭafā al-Tafrīshī

- $[=\mathcal{N}\!\mathit{aqd}\ \mathit{al-rij\bar{a}l}$ li-Mīr Muṣṭafā b. Ḥusayn al-Tafrīshī (d. 1021/1612–13)]
- (Āghā Buzurg, *Dharī* 'a, vol. 6, p. 228 no. 1278)
- 20f. *Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana ʿalā Amālī* al-Ṣadūq (d. 381/991) (Āghā Buzurg, *Dharīʿa*, vol. 6, p. 25 no. 97)
- 20g. Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana 'alā Mughnī al-Labīb 'an kutub al-a'ārīb [li-Jamāl ad-Dīn 'Abd Allāh b. Yūsuf b. Hishām (d. 761/1360)] (Tadhkira no. 18; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 6, p. 212 no. 1186; GAL, vol. 2, p. 23)
- 20h. Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana ʻalā l-Muṭawwal (Tadhkira no. 16)
- 20i. Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana 'alā Sharḥ al-Ṣaḥīfa [al-kāmila al-sajjādiyya] li-l-Sayyid 'Alī Khān [al-Madanī al-Dashtakī] (d. 1120/1708-9) (Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 6, p. 124 no. 669)
- 20k. *Ḥāshiya ghayr mudawwana ʿalā Khulāṣat al-ḥisāb* [li-l-Shaykh al-Bahāʾī] (*Tadhkira* no. 19)
- 21. Risāla fī mas'ala hisābiyya min al-mu'dilāt
- 22. Risāla fārisiyya fī ta'rīkh baladinā Tustar [= Tadhkira-yi Shūshtar/ Tadhkira-yi Shūshtar fī ta'rīkh-i Tustar]
 (C. A. Storey, Persian Literature. A Bio-Bibliographical Survey, London 1927–39, vol. 1 i, p. 365 no. 486; Munzawī, Fihrist, vol. 6, pp. 289–91; Āghā Buzurg, Dharī'a, vol. 3, p. 243–45 no. 900)
 Edition: Tadhkira-i Shūshtar. An account of Shūshtar, from the earliest time to A.H. 1169, with notices of its celebrated men and memories of the author's life 1–2, eds. Khan Bahadur Maula Bakhsh and M. Hidayet Husayn, Calcutta: Asiatic Society of Bengal, 1914–24 (Bibliotheca Indica; 206)
- 23. Risāla fī māl al-nāṣib wa-annahu laysa kull mukhālif nāṣiban (Āghā Buzurg, Dharīʿa, vol. 19, p. 27 no. 138)

References

- -Afandī, 'Abd Allāh b. 'Īsā, $\it Riy\bar ad$ al-'ulamā' 1–6, ed. Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī, Qum 1401/1981.
- Āghā Buzurg al-Ṭihrānī, al-Dharī'a ilā taṣānīf al-shī'a 1–25, Beirut 1403–6/1983–86.

 —, Muṣaffā al-maqāl fī muṣannifī 'ilm al-njāl, ed. Aḥmad Munzawī, Tehran 1378/1959.

 —, Tabagāt a'lām al-shī'a 1–2, Beirut 1390–91/1971; 3–5, ed. 'Alī Naqī Munzawī, Beirut 1392–95/1972–75; 6, ed. 'Alī Naqī Munzawī, Tehran 1362/1983.
- -Ahwānī, 'Abd al-'Azīz, "Kutub barāmij al-'ulamā' fī l-Andalus," *Majallat ma'had al-makhṭūṭāt al-'arabiyya* 1 i (1374/1955), pp. 91–120.

- Āl Maḥbūba, Ja'far Ibn Bāqir, Mādī al-Najaf wa-ḥādiruhā 1-3, Najaf 1374-78/1955-58. -Amīn, Muḥsin, A'yān al-shī'a 1-11, Beirut 1403/1983.
- Arjomand, Said Amir, The Shadow of God and the Hidden Imam. Religion, Political Order, and Societal Change in Shi'ite Iran from the Beginning to 1890, Chicago 1984.
- Autobiographie d'un clerc chiite du Čabal 'Āmil . . . Traduction et annotations par Sabrina Mervin et Haïtham al-Amin, Damascus 1998.
- -Baḥrānī, 'Alī b. Ḥasan al-Bilādī, Anwār al-badrayn fī tarājim 'ulamā' al-Qaṭīf wa-l-Aḥsā' wa-l-Baḥrayn, Najaf 1377/1957.
- Baḥrānī, Yūsuf b. Aḥmad, Lu'lu'at al-Baḥrayn, ed. Muḥammad Ṣādiq Baḥr al-'Ulūm, Najaf 1386/1966.
- Berkey, Jonathan, The Transmission of Knowledge in Medieval Cairo. A Social History of Islamic Education, Princeton 1992.
- Browne, Edward G., A Literary History of Persia 1-4, Cambridge 1902-24.
- Brunner, Rainer, "'Siehe, was mich an Unglück und Schrecken traf!' Schiitische Autobiographien," in Islamstudien ohne Ende. Festschrift für Werner Ende zum 65. Geburtstag, eds. Rainer Brunner, Monika Gronke, Jens Peter Laut and Ulrich Rebstock, Würzburg 2002, pp. 59–68.
- Chamberlain, Michael, Knowledge and Social Practice in Medieval Damascus, 1190-1350, Cambridge 1994.
- Cole, Juan R.I., "Ideology, Ethics, and Philosophical Discourse in Eighteenth Century
- an," *Iranian Studies* 22 i (1989), pp. 7–34. -, "Shi'i Clerics in Iraq and Iran, 1722–1780. The Akhbari-Usuli Conflict Reconsidered," Iranian Studies 18 i (1985), pp. 3-34.
- Dā'irat-i ma'ārif-i tashayyu' 1-, eds. Aḥmad Ṣadr Ḥājj Sayyid Jawādī, Kāmrān Fānī and Bahā' al-Dīn Khurramshāhī, Tehran 1380/2001-.
- Dickinson, Eerik, "Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ al-Shahrazūrī and the isnād," Journal of the American Oriental Society 122 (2002), pp. 481-505.
- Encyclopaedia Iranica, London 1985–.
- The Encyclopaedia of Islam. New Edition 1–11, Leiden 1960–2004.
- Ephrat, Daphna, A Learned Society in a Period of Transition. The Sunnī 'Ulama' of Eleventh-Century Baghdad, Albany 2000.
- Eschraghi, Armin, Frühe Šaihī- und Bābī-Theologie. Die Darlegung der Beweise für Muhammads besonderes Prophetentum (Ar-Risāla fi Itbāt an-Nubūwa al-Hāssa). Einleitung, Edition und Erläuterungen, Leiden et al. 2004.
- Foran, John, Fragile Resistance. Social Transformation in Iran from 1500 to the Revolution, Boulder/San Francisco/Oxford 1993.
- Gacek, Adam, The Arabic Manuscript Tradition. A Glossary of Technical Terms and Bibliography, Leiden 2001.
- GAL = Brockelmann, Carl, Geschichte der arabischen Litteratur 1–2, Leiden ²1943.
- GALS = Brockelmann, Carl, Geschichte der arabischen Litteratur. Supplementband 1-3, Leiden 1937-42.
- Gleave, Robert, "The Ijāza from Yūsuf al-Baḥrānī (d. 1186/1772) to Sayyid Muhammad Mahdī Bahr al-'Ulūm (d. 1212/1797-8)," Iran. Journal of the British Institute for Persian Studies 32 (1994), pp. 115-23.
- -Ijāza al-kabīra li-l-'Allāma . . . 'Abd Allāh al-Mūsawī al-Jazā' irī al-Tustarī, ed. Muḥammad al-Samāmī al-Hā'irī, Qum 1409/[1988-89].
- , Ms. Library of Congress, Call Number: BP63.I72H884 1815 [Orien Arab]. Ijāzāt al-ḥadīth allatī katabahā...al-Mawlā Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī al-Işbahānī, ed. Ahmad al-Husaynī, Qum 1410/1989-90.
- -Kahhāla, 'Umar Ridā, Mu'jam al-mu'allifīn. Tarājim muşannifī l-kutub al-'arabiyya 1–15, Beirut 1414/1993.
- -Khwānsārī, Muḥammad Bāqir, Rawdāt al-jannāt fī ahwāl al-'ulamā' wa-l-sādāt 1-8, Qum 1391/1987.
- Leder, Stefan, "Charismatic Scripturalism. The Hanbalī Magdisīs of Damascus," Der Islam 74 (1997), pp. 279-304.

- , "Hörerzertifikate als Dokumente für die islamische Lehrkultur des Mittelalters," in Urkunden und Urkundenformulare im Klassischen Altertum und in den orientalischen Kulturen, ed. Raif Georges Khoury, Heidelberg 1999, pp. 147-66.
- , "Eine neue Quelle zur Stadtgeschichte von Damaskus. Zur Alltagsgeschichte der Hadītwissenschaft," in Supplement XI der Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft (26. Deutscher Orientalistentag Leipzig 1995), Stuttgart 1998, pp. 268-79.
- , Spoken word and written text. Meaning and social significance of the Institution of Riwāya, Tokyo 2002 (Islamic Area Studies. Working Paper Series; 31).
- Leder, Stefan, Yāsīn Muḥammad al-Sawwās and Ma'mūn al-Ṣāġarǧī, Mu'ǧam alsamā'āt al-dimašģiyya. Les certificats d'audition à Damas 550-750h./1155-1349, Damascus 1996.
- , Recueil de documents facsimilés des certificats d'audition à Damas 550-750h./1155-1349. Mu'ğam al-samā'āt al-dimašqiyya, Damascus 2000.
- Lockhart, Laurence, Nadir Shah. A Critical Study Based Mainly Upon Contemporary Sources, London 1938.
- The Fall of the Safavi Dynasty and the Afghan Occupation of Persia, Cambridge 1958. -Majlisī, Muḥammad Bāqir, Biḥār al-anwār 0-28, 35-110, ed. Jawād 'Alawī [et al.], Tehran 1376-1405/1957-85.
- Mīrzā Muḥammad 'Alī Mudarris Tabrīzī, Rayḥānat al-adab fī tarājim al-ma'rūfīn bil-kunya wa-l-laqab, Tabrīz 1967-70.
- Modarressi Tabātabā'i, Hossein, An Introduction to Shī'ī Law. A bibliographical study, London 1984.
- Munzawī, Ahmad, Fihrist-i nuskhahā-yi khattī-yi fārsī 1-6, Tehran 1348-51/1969-72. Musalsalāt fī l-ijāzāt muḥtawiya 'alā ijāzāt 'ulamā' al-islām fī ḥaqq wālidī al-'Allāma Āyat Allāh al-ʿuzmā al-Sayyid Abī l-Maʿālī Shihāb al-Dīn al-Husaynī al-Marʿashī al-Najafī 1-2, Qum 1416/[1995-96].
- Ni'mat Allāh al-Jazā'irī, al-Anwār al-nu'māniyya 1-4, Tabrīz 1958-62.
- Perry, John, *Karim Khan Zand*, Chicago 1979. -Qazwīnī, 'Abd al-Nabī, *Tatmīm amal al-āmil*, ed. Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī, Qum 1407/ [1986-87].
- -Qummī, 'Abbās b. Muḥammad al-Riḍā, al-Fawā'id al-raḍawiyya fī aḥwāl 'ulamā' almadhhab al-ja'fariyya, Tehran 1327/1948.
- -Qummī, 'Abbās, al-Kunā wa-l-alqāb 1-3, Tehran 1368/1989.
- Rasā'il al-Shahīd al-thānī 1-2, ed. Riḍā al-Mukhtārī, Qum 1422/2001.
- Reynolds, Dwight F. (ed.), Interpreting the Self. Autobiography in the Arabic Literary Tradition, Berkeley/Los Angeles/London 2001.
- Roemer, Hans Robert, Persien auf dem Weg in die Neuzeit. Iranische Geschichte von 1350-1750, Beirut/Stuttgart 1989.
- Rosenthal, Franz, "Die arabische Autobiographie," Studia Arabica 1 (1937), pp. 3-40 [repr. in Franz Rosenthal, Muslim Intellectual and Social History. A Collection of Essays. Aldershot 1990, part V].
- Şadr, Ḥasan, Takmilat amal al-āmil, ed. Aḥmad al-Ḥusaynī, Beirut 1407/1986.
- Salati, Marco, "I maestri e le catene di trasmissione dell'insegnamento orale nel Ğabal 'āmil," in Onomastica e trasmissione del sapere nell'Islam medievale, ed. Biancamaria Scarcia Amoretti, Rom 1992, pp. 91-110.
- "La Lu'lu'a <sic> al-baḥrayn fī l-iǧāza li-qurratay al-'ayn di Šayḫ Yūsuf b. Aḥmad al-Baḥrānī (1107-1186/1695-1772). Per lo studio della šī'a di Baḥrayn," Annali di Ca' Foscari. Serie Orientale 28 (1989), pp. 111-45.
- -Samāhījī al-Baḥrānī, 'Abd Allāh b. Ṣālih, al-Ijāza al-kabīra ilā l-Shaykh Nāṣir al-Jārūdī al-Qatīfī, ed. Mahdī al-'Awāzim al-Qatīfī, Qum 1419/[1998-99].
- Savory, Roger, Iran under the Safavids, Cambridge 1980.
- Schmidtke, Sabine, "The *ÿāza* from 'Abd Allāh b. Ṣāliḥ al-Samāhījī to Nāṣir al-Jārūdī al-Qatīfī. A Source for the Twelver Shi'i Scholarly Tradition of Bahrayn," in Culture and Memory in Medieval Islam. Essays in Honour of Wilferd Madelung, eds. Farhad Daftary and Josef W. Meri, London 2003, pp. 64–85.

- , Theologie, Philosophie und Mystik im zwölferschütischen Islam des 9./15. Jahrhunderts. Die Gedankenwelt des Ibn Abī Jumhūr al-Aḥṣā'ī (um 838/1434–35—nach 906/1501), Leiden 2000.
- Stewart, Devin J., "The Autobiography of Yūsuf al-Baḥrānī (1696–1772)," in *Interpreting the Self: Autobiography in the Arabic Literary Tradition*, ed. Dwight F. Reynolds, Berkeley 2001, pp. 216–23.
- ——, "Capital, Accumulation, and the Islamic Academic Biography," *Edebiyât* 7 (1997), pp. 345–62.
- ——, "The Doctorate of Islamic Law in Mamluk Egypt and Syria," in *Law and Education in Medieval Islam. Studies in Memory of Professor George Makdisi*, eds. Joseph E. Lowry, Devin J. Stewart and Shawkat M. Toorawa, London 2004, pp. 45–90.
- ——, "The Humor of the Scholars. The Autobiography of Ni'mat Allāh al-Jazā'irī (d. 1112/1701)," *Iranian Studies* 22 (1989), pp. 47–81.
- —, Islamic Legal Orthodoxy. Twelver Shiite Responses to the Sunni Legal System, Salt Lake City 1998.
- Storey, Charles Ambrose, Persian Literature. A Bio-Bibliographical Survey, London 1927–39.
 Sublet, Jacqueline, Les maîtres et les études de deux traditionistes de l'époque mamelouke. Al-Mashyakha al-Bāsima lil-Qibābī wa Fāţima de Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalāni. Etude analytique, Damascus 1967 (Bulletin d'études orientales; 20).
- Tadhkira-i Shūshtar. An Account of Shūshtar, from the earliest time to A.H. 1169. With notices of its celebrated men and memories of the author's life 1–2. By Sayyid 'Abdallāh Bin Nūr al-Dīn Bin Ni'matallāh al-Ḥusaynī ash-Shūshtarī (surnamed Faqir), eds. Khān Bahādur Mawlā Bakhsh and Shams-ul-'Ulamā' M. Hidayet Husayn, Calcutta: Asiatic Society of Bengal, 1912–24 (Bibliotheca Indica; 206).
- Tūnakābunī, Muhammad b. Sulaymān, Qisas al-'ulamā', Tehran n.d.
- Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi, general ed. Y. Doç. Dr. Halis Ayhan, Istanbul 1988–.
- Vajda, Georges, "La transmission de la mašyaḥa (Asnā l-maqāṣid wa-a'dab al-mawārid) d'Ibn al-Buḥārī d'après le manuscrit Reisülküttab 262 de la Bibliothèque Süleymaniye d'Istanbul," Rivista degli studi orientali 48 (1973–74), pp. 55–74.
- Walbridge, Linda S. (ed.), The Most Learned of the Shi'a. The Institution of the Marja^c Taglid, Oxford 2001.
- Witkam, Jan Just, "Lists of books in Arabic manuscripts," *Manuscripts of the Middle East* 5 (1990–91), pp. 123–36.